

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

Ref. T20177306

IN THE CROWN COURT AT BRADFORD

Exchange Square
Drake Street
Bradford

Before HIS HONOUR JUDGE DURHAM HALL QC
THE RECORDER OF BRADFORD

R E G I N A

- v -

**BASHARAT IQBAL KHALIQ, SAEED AKHTAR, YASAR MAJID,
NAVEED AKHTAR, PARVAZE AFZAL AHMED, IZAR KHAN HUSSAIN,
KIERAN HARRIS, ZEESHAN ALI, FAHIM IQBAL, MOHAMMED USMAN**

**MS K MELLY QC and MS S BEATTIE (instructed by the Crown Prosecution Service)
appeared on behalf of the Prosecution**

**MR A IQBAL QC and MR F ARSHAD appeared on behalf of the Defendant Khaliq
MR P MOULSON QC and MR A SHAKOOR appeared on behalf of the Defendant
Saeed Akhtar**

MS G BATTIS appeared on behalf of the Defendant Majid

MR R FRIEZE appeared on behalf of the Defendant Naveed Akhtar

MR A BELL appeared on behalf of the Defendant Ahmed

MS G KELLY appeared on behalf of the Defendant Hussain

MR G WILSON appeared on behalf of the Defendant Harris

MS F HERTZOG appeared on behalf of the Defendant Ali

MR A DALLAS appeared on behalf of the Defendant Iqbal

MR R FERM appeared on behalf of the Defendant Usman

PROCEEDINGS

17th JANUARY 2019, 10.04-15.55

REPORTING RESTRICTIONS APPLY:
SECTION 4(2) OF THE CONTEMPT OF COURT ACT 1981
SEXUAL OFFENCES (AMENDMENT) ACT 1992

A

DISCLAIMER: The quality of audio for this hearing is the responsibility of the Court. Poor audio can adversely affect the accuracy, and we have used our best endeavours herein to produce a high-quality transcript.

B

WARNING: reporting restrictions may apply to the contents transcribed in this document, particularly if the case concerned a sexual offence or involved a child. Reporting restrictions prohibit the publication of the applicable information to the public or any section of the public, in writing, in a broadcast or by means of the internet, including social media. Anyone who receives a copy of this transcript is responsible in law for making sure that applicable restrictions are not breached. A person who breaches a reporting restriction is liable to a fine and/or imprisonment. For guidance on whether reporting restrictions apply, and to what information, ask at the court office or take legal advice.

C

This Transcript is Crown Copyright. It may not be reproduced in whole or in part other than in accordance with relevant licence or with the express consent of the Authority. All rights are reserved.

D

E

F

G

H

A
B
C
D
E
F
G
H

INDEX

Page

[PERSON YY], Sworn

Examined-in-chief by MS MELLY 5

Cross-examined by MR MOULSON 12

Cross-examined by MR WILSON 17

Re-examined by MS MELLY 20

[PERSON G], Sworn

Examined-in-chief by MS MELLY 32

Cross-examined by MR MOULSON 46

Re-examined by MS MELLY 51

██████████, Affirmed

Examined-in-chief by MS MELLY 61

Cross-examined by MR MOULSON 71

A

[REDACTED]

B

[REDACTED]

C

[REDACTED]

D

[REDACTED]

E

[REDACTED]

F

[REDACTED]

G

[REDACTED]

(The jury entered court at 10.07)

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: All right, brilliant.

MS MELLY: Thank you. Then we will deal with the evidence of [Person U] before we move and then complete the social work evidence.

H

[PERSON YY], Sworn

A

Examined in-chief by MS MELLY

Q. Your full name, please?

A. [Person YY].

B

Q. Now having just heard you give your name and you're currently facing me, would you mind, please, directing your answers over to members of the jury and I think you're going to have to keep your voice up?

A. OK, yes.

Q. All right.

A. [Person YY].

C

MS MELLY: Thank you. Just let me - we were anticipating calling another person at this time. It just takes me a moment to bring up my page.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Could you tell me where this gentleman's statement is?

MS MELLY: Certainly.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Please, does any ---

D

MS MELLY: 156.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: I?

MS MELLY: I156.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Is that the page or the number of the witness?

E

MS MELLY: I believe I've correctly given your Honour the right reference.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: That's fine, good, thank you very much.

MS MELLY: But I just look to my learned friend, it takes a moment for me if I move the mic over to ---

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Yes, you're right, thank you.

F

MS MELLY: Thank you.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: There we are, social worker, yes, Bradford Council, yes.

MS MELLY: All right, thank you. So you - we understand that you were a social worker employed by Bradford Council. You've worked in a variety of roles during your time as a social worker, but in two thousand - 2009, 2010, you were working with a young lady called

G

[Person A], is that correct?

A. That's correct, yes.

Q. Now when you first started working with [Person A], had she already moved on from [Location B2]?

A. Yes, she had.

H

Q. All right. And what sort of accommodation was she in, please?

A

A. If I recall, she was in a mother and baby unit in the Bradford area.

Q. Thank you.

A. Briefly.

Q. We know that she had her baby, [Person S], she had care of [Person S] for a short period of time?

B

A. That's correct, yes.

Q. All right. So that's in that initial period of time?

A. Yes.

C

Q. Right, thank you. And can you assist, please, with how frequently - I'm not expecting the precise dates but you were in contact with [Person A1] during that initial period of time that you were working with her?

A. Well, the statutory guidance is every 28 days, but I would probably see her when she was in Bradford once a week, maybe once every two weeks.

D

Q. And you say you'd seen her during that period of time, would you be having general phone contact and so forth as well?

A. Yes.

Q. And was your role essentially to try and help [Person A1] move into independent living?

E

A. Yes.

Q. To keep herself safe?

A. Yes.

Q. To try and get her to access some education or training?

A. Yes.

F

Q. Now can you help us, please, in terms of your relationship with [Person A1] in terms of how open, for example, she would be with you?

A. Well, whilst I was her social worker she had the baby removed, so after that period she was quite distant in terms of opening up her feelings and how she felt, so it was really quite a difficult relationship after the baby was removed.

G

Q. Thank you very much. I'm just checking to see, members of the jury, are - no. Members of the jury, are indicating that they really are ---

A. OK.

Q. --- struggling to hear you, [Person YY2]?

H

- A** A. Right, OK. After the baby was removed from her care, I would say the relationship was - it was OK but she was quite defensive in terms of anything I would ask her in terms of personal relationships.
- Q. And what about her general mood when she was with you, please?
- B** A. Her general mood?
- Q. Yes.
- A. Overall, it was - it was - it was OK, really, average teenager, so a little bit moody sometimes, quiet sometimes; yes, nothing alarming in terms of her mood.
- Q. And so you've tried to describe the relationship, but if you were asking her precise questions about who were you with, are you in a relationship?
- C** A. Yes.
- Q. You know, give us some detail, how would she react to that when you were actually asking her specific questions?
- A. I would say she was quite defensive and probably say that it probably wasn't my business.
- D** Q. She would say it wasn't your business?
- A. Yes.
- Q. That sort of phrase?
- A. Yes.
- E** MS MELLY: Now I just want to ask you about some entries, please, in terms of the records. Is there a file within that witness box or has it been ---
- USHER: Yes (inaudible).
- MS MELLY: Thank you. It's the one with [PERSON A7], please. Perfect, thank you very much. So towards the back of this the page (inaudible).
- F** A. Yes.
- Q. So we're now dealing with the 18th of June 2010. It's an entry from you, is that correct?
- A. Yes.
- G** Q. Thank you. And it indicates that you had been informed that [Person A1] was missing. It had been reported to the police. "[Person A1]'s had a mixed week, sometimes cooperative, sometimes not. [Person A1] not answering her mobile. It's just ringing out". And it also says, "[Person A1]'s going missing is not unexpected considering the pattern of behaviour. Relapses back into own negative behaviour predictable".
- H** A. Yes.

- A**
- Q. "She has been at CMS for two weeks".
- A. Right, yes.
- Q. OK. So being at CMS, please.
- A. Yes.
- B**
- Q. Does CMS stand for Care, I think it's Care Management Solutions, is that correct?
- A. That's correct, yes.
- Q. OK. Is that the same as the mother and baby unit that you've said that [Person A1] was living at?
- A. No.
- C**
- Q. No?
- A. No, that was in Bradford.
- Q. Right.
- A. So she had a - when you first started working with her, she's at a mother and baby unit.
- D**
- A. Yes.
- Q. Then you've told us that, during that period of time, [Person S] was removed?
- A. Yes.
- Q. And was she then moved into CMS?
- A. I can't recall. I think she briefly lived with her mother.
- E**
- Q. Yes.
- A. And then maybe moved on to CMS, but I can't - I couldn't recall the exact sequence.
- Q. No, no, not - and, in fact, there's mention of the bed and breakfast accommodation as well?
- F**
- A. Yes, she might have - she might have well been there, yes.
- Q. All right. But we can take it from this that she has moved; by this point you're still working with her?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Under Care Management Solutions?
- G**
- A. Yes, yes.
- Q. Thank you. Over the page, please. Again, [Person A1] - [Person A1] is still missing by this point. Sorry, this is the 30th of June 2010 and you were made aware that [Person A1] had not been seen by that point for some seven days and so [Person A1]'s missing status was upgraded from authorised absence to missing person?
- H**
- A. Yes.

- A**
- Q. Right. And so without wanting to take you through to each and every entry that you will have been involved in the care records, was it the case then that throughout this period, perhaps intermittently, [Person A1] would still be going missing at night?
- A. Yes, yes.
- B**
- Q. And, as we can see, sometimes not seen for some days?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Thank you. Just onto the next page, please, 136, we're dealing now with the 7th of July 2010. [Person A1] had been missing at this point but had come back?
- A. Yes.
- C**
- Q. Yes?
- A. Yes.
- Q. And then it says, "[Person A1] will probably spend time with someone else for a period of time. [Person A1] doesn't see the danger or that she is being used". Now why is it that you've made that entry, what conversation have you had with [Person A1]?
- D**
- A. She came across sometimes as quite self-assured and that she would - she knew that --
-
- Q. Pause there. I'm going to have to repeat it, because even the first row of the jury clearly can't hear you.
- A. Oh, OK.
- E**
- Q. And the microphones can't help you.
- A. Oh, they can't help, OK.
- Q. They're just recording, all right.
- A. OK.
- F**
- Q. I know it's misleading.
- A. OK.
- Q. But you said she came across sometimes as quite self-assured?
- A. She did, yes, and I think she was in that mode where she really didn't ask for support from social services and she was trying to deal with the separation of the child and sometimes
- G**
- a lot of mothers just adopt maladaptive behaviours and they sort of go missing and engage in sort of negative coping strategies.
- Q. What does negative coping strategies mean?
- A. Going missing, drinking, drugs, sex with strangers, that kind of stuff.
- H**

A Q. Thank you. And we can see, I don't need to take you through it, returning intoxicated with alcohol, entries about that, you can see that over on page 137: saying she's been out most of the night in Bradford, coming back early in the morning intoxicated with alcohol?

A. Right, yes.

B Q. Was that something that you were dealing with with [Person A]?

A. Well, she was in a CMS placement, so obviously I was relying on them to give me the information and then I would record it. So, yes, if that's what's been written, that's what it was, yes.

C Q. OK, thank you. Now onto page 139, please. Now without going into the entirety of this entry, can I check with you: contact from [REDACTED] to inform you about something that had been - that was being investigated by the police officer, Karen George, is that [REDACTED] at that time?

A. I can't remember without the surname.

Q. Sorry?

D A. I can't remember.

Q. Thank you. Page 141. You were receiving - well, I don't want you to go into what you'd heard from other people because we'll hear from, directly from those witnesses. But this is in August 2010, you'd indicated that [Person A1] seemed to be trying to break her pattern of behaviour, so do we get the pattern: still drinking, still out, but an up and down period of time overall?

A. Yes.

Q. All right, thank you.

A. Yes.

F Q. 144, please, September 2010, indications on the records that she was self-harming during this period of time, is that something that you were aware of?

A. Yes. I can't remember specific details but, yes, I think she did some superficial self-harming, yes.

Q. I'm struggling now, [Person YY2]?

G A. I can't remember specifically what the self-harming was but she did engage in some superficial self-harming.

Q. Other entries in relation to self-harm you will have made during this period of time when you received that information, do you agree?

A. Yes.

H

A Q. Thank you. And were you also made aware, and I can take you to the specific references if required, that you were made aware that there were concerns that, in addition to alcohol abuse, [Person A] was engaged in drug use?

A. Yes, yes.

B Q. Thank you very much.

A. Yes.

Q. Was [Person A1] ever open in discussing that with you?

A. No, not really.

Q. No.

C A. No, she never saw it as a problem at the time.

MS MELLY: Thank you. Thank you very much.

MR IQBAL: No, questions, thank you.

Cross-examined by MR MOULSON

D Q. [Person YY2], could we just establish some dates to begin with, please. Is it right that you had input into [Person A1]'s care between April of 2009 and December of 2010?

A. Yes.

Q. Yes.

A. Yes.

E Q. Thank you. And what sort of frequency would you see her on a weekly or a monthly basis, could you give us an example?

A. Well, when she was in the Bradford area, we'd try and see her on a weekly basis but when she moved to the CMS it would be within statutory guidelines of within 28 days. And the reason for that was because obviously she had staff with her all day, so I knew there was a staff member when she wasn't missing would be with her all the time.

F Q. Right. So if I suggested to you that between April 2009 and December 2010 you would have seen [Person A1] on about 30 or 40 occasions, would that be fair?

A. I couldn't recall the numbers, no, I don't know, I can't say.

Q. Well, can you give a ---

G A. Because we're talking 10 years ago, I can't tell you numbers, how many times I've seen someone within that period.

Q. Right. So we can agree on this, can we; initially, you saw her on a weekly basis, yes?

A. Yes, I tried to, yes.

Q. For how long?

H A. Before she moved to Dewsbury.

- A**
- Q. Before she moved to Dewsbury?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Right. And after that, at least every 28 days, is that right?
- A. Within 28 days, yes.
- B**
- Q. Yes, right. I wonder if we could turn to a timeline document that you may have, [Person YY2], or it can be given. Ladies and gentlemen, can we turn to page 23 of the timeline, please. Thank you. [Person YY2], bottom centre there are numbers on these pages, could I invite you to turn to 23, please. Thank you. Do you have that, 23, [Person YY2]?
- A. 23 of 34, yes.
- C**
- Q. Thank you. And if you go to the very top and the entry reading, July to September, and we see an entry, [Person S1] [REDACTED] of July 2009, do you have that? That's [Person A1]'s daughter, [Person S]?
- A. Yes, yes.
- D**
- Q. On the very top line. Do you see that?
- A. The very top right?
- Q. The very top line.
- A. Yes.
- Q. Of the boxed entries.
- A. Yes.
- E**
- Q. If you go to an entry which is - well, there's the 10th and then there's 18.00, but we know that that box says, "[REDACTED] July [Person S1] born".
- A. Yes.
- Q. Yes.
- F**
- A. Yes.
- Q. [Person A1]'s daughter born, yes?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Now if we move to the far right of that table, [Person YY2].
- A. Yes.
- G**
- Q. Whilst it's not recorded on that timeline, we know from an exhibit you have - from a document you've provided in this case, and it's J3712 if anybody wants the reference, that [Person S] was removed from [Person A1]'s care to the care of [Person A1]'s mother, [REDACTED] on the 1st of December of 2009, do you agree with that?
- A. Yes.
- H**
- Q. Thank you.

- A**
- A. Yes.
- Q. So if we might just helpfully mark, your Honour, ladies and gentlemen, if it helps, [Person S] removed to care of [Person A1]'s mother, 1st of December. Thank you. Now is that the time that you're saying that [Person A1] moved to Dewsbury?
- B**
- A. Like I said, I can't remember the sequence. I think she probably spent some time in a B&B prior to moving on to Dewsbury.
- Q. Right. It was after that that she moved to Dewsbury, yes?
- A. From memory, yes.
- Q. Right.
- C**
- A. That's (inaudible) - so, yes.
- Q. So I'm sorry if that appeared a little laboured, [Person YY2], but we can from that assume, can we, that you saw [Person A1] on a weekly basis then up to at least December 2009 from April 2009? You've told us that when she ---
- A. Yes.
- D**
- Q. --- moved to Dewsbury?
- A. Yes.
- Q. You saw her?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Pursuant to statutory requirement?
- E**
- A. Yes.
- Q. At least every 28 days?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Is that correct?
- F**
- A. Yes.
- Q. Before that, you were seeing her on a weekly basis?
- A. I tried to see her on a weekly basis, yes.
- Q. Right. So from April to December of 2009, you saw her on a weekly basis?
- A. Right, I tried to, yes.
- G**
- Q. Right. That's a period of approximately, let's take, eight months?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Eight times four is 32?
- A. Yes.
- Q. So you saw her on 32 occasions, yes, up to December 2009?
- H**
- A. Mm-mm.

A

Q. Yes? Yes?

A. Probably.

Q. Right.

A. I can't recall.

B

Q. But, thereafter, you saw her at least every 28 days for about a year to December 2010, yes?

A. Yes.

Q. Yes.

C

A. So 32 plus 12 is 42. So I'm going to back to my original question: do you think you saw her on about 30 to 40 occasions during your time with her?

A. I can't recall how many times I've seen her is the honest answer.

Q. Right. I'll move on. Your Honour, as the jury will hear by agreed fact, on the 1st of April of 2015, a letter of claim was sent by a firm of solicitors called Switalskis on [Person A1]'s behalf to commence proceedings, possible proceedings against the Bradford

D

Metropolitan District Council, Bradford MDC. So just pausing, [Person YY2], to explain the context of my next questions. It is this. [Person A1] instructs a firm of Switalskis to act on her behalf?

A. Yes.

E

Q. Yes?

A. Yes.

Q. Switalskis write on the 1st of April of 2015 to the Bradford Metropolitan District Council, yes?

A. Yes.

F

Q. [Person A1] brings a claim. The Metropolitan District Council wish to defend it and they employ a firm called Berrymans, solicitors in Manchester, to defend the claim, yes?

A. Yes.

Q. So [Person A1] and Switalskis, Bradford Metropolitan District Council and Berrymans?

G

A. Yes.

Q. Yes. And that firm, Berrymans, approached you, did they not, to give a statement concerning your knowledge and care of [Person A1], is that right?

A. Yes.

H

- A** MR MOULSON: Thank you. Now I can - I think it's probably best if you have a copy of this statement and I have a copy for your Honour as well (Conferred with Ms Melly). Yes, of course, thank you.
- JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Thank you.
- B** MR MOULSON: Do you have a copy of that ---
- A. Yes.
- Q. --- [Person YY2], yes?
- A. I do, yes.
- Q. Thank you. And I'd just like to take you to various entries in it, yes. You make reference as follows, don't you, "I think [Person A1] was 16 or 17 when the leaving care team had involvement with her", is that right?
- C**
- A. Yes.
- Q. And you were involved with the leaving care team at that stage, weren't you?
- A. I was.
- D** Q. Right. And if you go down to paragraph 10, please, of that statement.
- A. Yes.
- Q. You say this, don't you, [Person YY2], "[Person A1] was a very headstrong young woman"?
- A. Yes.
- E** Q. Is that correct?
- A. Yes.
- Q. "She did not strike me as being vulnerable in that she could be compelled to do something against her will".
- F** A. Yes.
- Q. Is that correct?
- A. Yes, that's what I said.
- Q. "Whilst my involvement in the case came a little later, she never discussed any issues with me that caused concern regarding child sexual exploitation".
- G** A. Yes.
- Q. Is that right?
- A. Yes.
- Q. You do recall her saying that she had an Asian boyfriend who was a similar age, is that correct?
- H** A. Yes.

- A** Q. Thank you. And over the page to paragraph 12, please, is this the entry, “As far as I can recall, [Person A1] never had the usual signs and trappings of being groomed such as jewellery, a new phone and new clothes et cetera”, is that correct?
- A. Yes.
- B** Q. Further on, “I never saw her looking anything other than plain and non-made-up. She did not present in a way that suggested that there were men spending money on her”, is that correct?
- A. That’s correct, yes.
- C** Q. Paragraph 16, “I note that [Person A1] was offered a lot of support in terms of referral to CAMHS and child psychologists, but she steadfastly refused any support or input from professionals”, is that correct?
- A. Yes.
- D** Q. Thank you. So that concludes my questions about that statement, [Person YY2], but just this. On the number of occasions that you saw her, however many there were, other than injuries which you can put down to superficial self-harm, you never saw her with any injuries, did you?
- A. Injuries?
- Q. Yes?
- E** A. No, I didn’t personally see her with injuries, no.
- MR MOULSON: Thank you very much indeed.
- Cross-examined by MR WILSON
- F** Q. [Person YY2], just a few questions, please.
- A. Yes.
- Q. Those entries which are 3,710, J3710 onwards. On the 23rd of November, [Person A1] was residing at the Gingerbread Project, do you recall that?
- A. Where, sorry?
- Q. The Gingerbread Project.
- A. Yes, I think so.
- G** Q. And your record or your notes in respect of that indicate that she was having unauthorised visitors?
- A. Yes.
- Q. And that she wasn’t sticking to the terms of the conditions of the project?
- A. That’s right.
- H** Q. And, ultimately, she was asked to leave, is that correct?

- A** A. She - yes.
- Q. Another entry's 3712. You note there that, "[Person A1] needs to start to deal with her issues primarily at least her anger", yes?
- A. Yes.
- B** Q. 3713, again you refer to her as, "Blaming everyone else and venting her frustrations on myself. I informed [Person A1] that she will have to show and develop some maturity or look at her dealing with her issues in relation to anger", yes?
- A. Yes.
- Q. 3719, you note this on the 23rd of December 2009, "There's still no change in [Person A1]'s thinking or thought processes, not her fault, not accepting responsibilities for her actions", yes?
- C** A. Yes.
- Q. So that's your, what you see in relation to her?
- A. Yes.
- D** Q. That she's not taking responsibility for anything. Everyone else is to blame (inaudible), yes?
- A. Yes.
- Q. 3727, please, and it's - this is now the 3rd of February 2010 and you visit her on this occasion and you were asking her if she'd had a good weekend and she was verbally aggressive towards you although not swearing. She didn't want to discuss or talk about anything, correct?
- E** A. Yes.
- Q. And then 3735, you note this, "[Person A1] is still entrenched in her patterns of behaviour where she's doing what she wants, avoidance and aggressive defensive behaviour and not yet prepared to consider other positive alternatives".
- F** JUDGE DURHAM HALL: What page is this, please?
- MR WILSON: This is the 13th of April 2010 now, your Honour. Yes?
- A. Yes, yes.
- G** JUDGE DURHAM HALL: So how was she presenting, did you say, Mr Wilson?
- MR WILSON: "Still entrenched in her patterns of behaviour where she's doing what she wants, avoidance and aggressive defensive behaviours and not yet prepared to consider other positive alternatives". Presuming with respect to the last bit of that that you're referring to the support or help that was being offered by social services at all which she wasn't prepared
- H** to accept, yes?

A

A. That's right.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: I think it's the negative coping strategies ---

A. Yes.

Q. --- that you were worried about?

B

A. Yes.

MR WILSON: So she had all the support but she wasn't taking advantage of it or refused to take advantage of it, is that correct?

A. That's right.

C

Q. Finally, 37 - oh, no, sorry, not finally, 3740, this is now the 13th of May 2010 and you note this, "[Person A1] is still finding difficulty listening to other people's points of view. When solutions are offered, she quickly moves on to other issues or states that it will not happen and people involved are lying. Still very verbally aggressive and tries to communicate via body language". And that's what you note there, correct?

A. Yes.

D

Q. And then, finally, can I just deal with the records in our file. Now you've been referred to September 2010 and this is page 143, 10th of September 2010. And what you note on this occasion is that when you were speaking to her, when you visited her, all that she could talk about that time was that - of getting her own place or a flat, yes?

A. Yes.

E

Q. The only other thing she talked about was the night out on the forthcoming weekend, correct?

A. Yes.

F

Q. And then what you also note is that she - she hated being where she was, and I think that at that time where was she at that time, do you recall?

A. I don't recall what date - what month was it?

Q. It's September 2010.

A. I can't recall. But I don't think she liked any of her placements, so nothing unusual there.

G

Q. And, well, what you also note is that in your opinion or what you say, "[Person A1]'s behaviour and behaviour over the last three months has indicated that she's not really ready to live independently due to her behaviours", yes?

A. Yes.

H

Q. And that she was worried - oh, sorry, you can't hear me or him? I think the answer was yes?

A

A. I'm just saying "yes" at the moment, yes.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Yes, best not to have a quiet chat between the two of you, obviously, or me. What was the answer to the - what was the question, Mr Wilson, sorry?

B

MR WILSON: That this gentlemen has noted, that [Person YY2] has noted that [Person A1]'s behaviour over the last three months have indicated that she's not really ready to live independently; but she was threatening to discharge herself, or wanting to discharge herself, is that correct?

A. Yes, yes.

C

Q. And did she get angry about the fact that she didn't have her own place, wasn't getting her own way?

A. Yes, she did, yes.

MR WILSON: Thank you very much.

Re-examined by MS MELLY

D

Q. Just dealing first with the number of meetings between you and [Person A1].

A. Yes.

Q. You've been asked questions ---

A. Yes.

Q. --- by my learned friend about working out your obligations, essentially?

E

A. Yes.

Q. And from that trying to extrapolate how many times ---

A. Yes.

Q. --- you met her. And one of the things that you kept saying was, "I tried to meet her"?

A. Yes.

F

Q. And I just wonder if you could explain why you were distinguishing that, please?

A. Well, I'm not duty bound to see her on a weekly basis. The Children's Act say I have to visit within 28 days.

Q. Pause there. You're not duty bound to see her every week, sorry, yes?

G

A. But obviously if she was living in a B&B, so obviously quite vulnerable, not an ideal placement for a child, so I would try and see her on a more frequent basis. But sometimes she would be there, sometimes she wouldn't be there. She wouldn't answer her phone. Sometimes, I couldn't get there. You know, there's various reasons why I wouldn't meet up with her.

H

Q. All right. So the numbers might be right in terms of how many times you would have expected to meet?

- A**
- A. Yes, yes.
- Q. Right.
- A. Nothing outside of statutory guidance, no.
- Q. And in terms again of statutory guidance was that you were supposed to try and see
- B** her within that period of time?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Yes.
- A. Yes.
- Q. Right. And you've told us I think already sometimes she wouldn't answer her phone?
- C**
- A. Yes, very rare - very rarely answered her phone. I would only get contact from [Person A1] mostly if she was waiting for her weekly allowance of money. That would be probably the time I would see [Person A1]. Otherwise, she was very hard to pin down unless she was at her mother's house.
- Q. Thank you. And you've told us that it - part of your obligations would depend on
- D** where she was living and you said that there was a period of time when she was a child living at a bed and breakfast when she was quite vulnerable?
- A. Yes, if my memory serves me right after the child was removed she had to leave the mothers and baby unit. There were no placement at the time so she had to live in a B&B
- E** while we sorted a placement out for her.
- Q. Thank you. And then, please, dealing with the statement that you made in terms of - to Berrymans Solicitors?
- A. Oh, yes, that one, yes.
- Q. Right. So, firstly, did you understand that if we look at this witness statement, there
- F** are a number of paragraphs where you're explaining why it was that [Person A1] couldn't be placed in a secure unit?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Did you understand ---
- A. Yes.
- G** Q. --- that that was part of what your statement was about?
- A. Yes, I think so.
- Q. Sorry?
- A. I think so, yes.
- Q. Thank you. And, then, looking at it, do you still have a copy of it?
- H** A. Yes.

- A**
- Q. Part or parts of it have been read to you, but I just want you to look at some other passages if we can, please, because you've expressed a view about vulnerability in it.
- A. Yes.
- Q. All right. As per your paragraph 7.
- B**
- A. Yes.
- Q. You've said that [Person A1], in dealing with her background but you've then said [Person A1] was subsequently placed - I'm halfway through paragraph 7 - at [Location B2].
- A. Yes.
- Q. Do you have that?
- C**
- A. Yes.
- Q. Where ---
- A. Yes.
- Q. --- concerns first arose that she was staying out overnight and was possibly at risk of child sexual exploitation?
- D**
- A. That's right.
- Q. So you were aware of that, were you?
- A. Yes, before my involvement.
- Q. Sorry?
- A. That was before my involvement, when she was at the residential.
- E**
- Q. But you were made aware ---
- A. I was aware, yes.
- Q. --- of that?
- A. Oh, yes.
- F**
- Q. Once you became involved ---
- A. Yes.
- Q. --- in [Person A1]'s care?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Right. And your next paragraph, you've said it was the case that child sexual
- G** exploitation was less in the consciousness back in 2008?
- A. Yes, yes, that's correct.
- Q. "Obviously, since then due to high profile cases it's increased in profile and is now a political issue".
- A. Yes.
- H**
- Q. And you go on, "A lot of looked after children do engage in risky behaviours".

- A**
- A. Yes, they do, yes.
- Q. And has that been your experience?
- A. Yes, it still is, yes.
- Q. Thank you. "It's often their way of compensating for a lack of love and attention they've received at home".
- B**
- A. Yes.
- Q. "They're attracted to the men that groom them in respect that they do not receive" - "That they do receive the attention they do not get elsewhere".
- A. That's right. I mean, that's not just my opinion; it's based in research as well, that is the view, yes.
- C**
- Q. And you go on then and say, "My recollection of [Person A1] was that she was a very headstrong young woman".
- A. Yes.
- Q. You say, and this is the part that was read, "She did not strike me as being vulnerable in that she could be compelled to do something against her will".
- D**
- A. That's right, yes.
- Q. You say, "Whilst my involvement in the case came a little later, she never discussed any issues with me that caused concern regarding sexual exploitation".
- A. No.
- E**
- Q. All right.
- A. Well, if I was part of the process to remove the child, I think she would find it very difficult to sort of confide in me in terms of these kinds of negative behaviours because she would have wanted to try and get her child back as well.
- F**
- Q. Right.
- A. So I'm ---
- Q. Just pause there because I just want to make sure we heard that. OK. Difficult - I think you say difficult to confide in you?
- A. Yes.
- G**
- Q. You say during this period of time she was trying to get her child back, was she?
- A. Yes, she wanted to go to court and try and get her child back, but I was part of the process in terms of removing the child with the child's social worker, so ---
- Q. You were part of the pro - in terms of perception ---
- A. Well, they were asking me for information.
- H**
- Q. Yes.

- A**
- A. Which I contributed to the core assessment of the - of the assessment for [Person A1]'s child to be removed.
- Q. So would [Person A1] have been aware that you had played some part ---
- A. Oh, yes.
- B**
- Q. --- in the structure ---
- A. Yes.
- Q. --- that removed the child from her care?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Right. Now I just want to be clear about this paragraph because you've said she never
- C**
- discussed any issues with me ---
- A. That's right.
- Q. --- that cause concern regarding child sexual exploitation?
- A. That's right.
- Q. But if we look back at the records, were you being made aware by others ---
- D**
- A. Yes.
- Q. --- that there were risks to [Person A1] ---
- A. Yes.
- Q. --- of child sexual exploitation?
- A. Yes:
- E**
- Q. Right.
- A. It's the way, the questions are not here, are they, so you've only got the answers, so it looks different.
- Q. It looks different, so just explain what you mean then, just flesh that out?
- F**
- A. That was just my personal view if I was - if when I had seen anything to give me concern. On the occasions that I saw [Person A1], there was nothing to say that she was being sexually exploited.
- Q. From what you saw?
- A. But that doesn't mean it wasn't happening; it's just that I personally hadn't seen
- G**
- anything.
- Q. But let's, if we deal with and we can look at the records if we need to of the things that you were aware of during this period of the time then.
- A. Yes.
- Q. Yes.
- H**
- A. Yes.

- A**
- Q. Were you aware about her going missing overnight?
- A. Yes.
- Q. That there was alcohol and drug use?
- A. Yes.
- B**
- Q. That she had low moods and volatile moods?
- A. She did, yes.
- Q. That she was self-harming?
- A. Yes, superficially, I think if I remember - recall.
- Q. Yes.
- C**
- A. Yes.
- Q. And that there were fears by others working with her?
- A. Yes.
- Q. That she was spending time with older Asian men?
- A. Yes.
- D**
- Q. And you go on, paragraph 11, "The approach at the time if there were concerns about child sexual exploitation was to provide the information that we had to the police. We could not physically prevent a child from leaving a care home or foster home", is that right?
- A. That's correct, yes.
- E**
- Q. "If a criminal offence was being committed it was something that only the police could act upon, there was often little more we could do".
- A. Yes.
- Q. Right. And then you go on about not having - the paragraph that's been read about not having the usual signs such as jewellery and new phone and so forth?
- F**
- A. That's right.
- Q. And not looking made up?
- A. That's right.
- Q. All right. And was that statement based on what you saw?
- A. Yes.
- G**
- Q. When you met her?
- A. Yes, yes.
- Q. Were you aware of where she got the money for the alcohol and drugs from?
- A. No, not really, but we did give her a weekly allowance which they come to the live in care system they are allowed a weekly allowance of forty something pounds a week. So I
- H**

- A** presumed it could have been that on some - no, but the money was managed, actually, no, I wasn't aware, if I'm honest because the money was managed by CMS on a quite strict basis.
- Q. So looking back now at your paragraph 12 about her ---
- A. Yes.
- B** Q. About the money and so forth.
- A. Yes.
- Q. Is that accurate?
- A. Yes, it is, yes.
- Q. But in terms of how she funded the alcohol or drugs, can you explain that?
- C** A. No, no.
- Q. And then over the page, please, paragraph 13, "One option for social services in terms of dealing with the risk of child sexual exploitation is to move a child out of the area. This is something we used to do a lot and prior to mobile phones it was a fairly successful tactic".
- A. That's correct, yes.
- D** Q. "Unfortunately, the advent of mobile phones means that moving a child out of area tends to be less successful".
- A. Yes.
- Q. And that's during the period of time that you were dealing with [Person A1], that's what you're explaining, is that?
- E** A. Yes, yes.
- Q. "Children will unfortunately disclose their whereabouts and, depending on where the child is moved to contact is often resumed within their groomers".
- A. Unfortunately, yes.
- F** Q. And then it goes on, "We've had to strike the right balance between moving a child out of the area and allowing them to have contact with family members".
- A. Yes.
- Q. "We will often tend to move the child out of the area but not so far away that contact will not be maintained".
- G** A. Yes.
- Q. You then deal with the criteria for moving a child out of the area and you finish that paragraph with, "Such placements are often expensive and difficult to come by".
- A. Yes, yes.
- Q. And you note that [Person A1] was offered a lot of support in terms of the referrals, as
- H** we've heard, to mental health service, the child psychologist?

- A**
- A. Yes.
- Q. But she steadfastly refused support or input from professionals?
- A. That's right.
- Q. And you go on, "In my experience, it's not uncommon for children who come into
- B** care late to refuse support".
- A. That's correct, yes.
- Q. "They're often reluctant to address their concerns with therapy and tend to self-medicate with drugs and/or risky behaviours".
- A. Yes, yes.
- C** Q. And you explain then it's not possible to compel a child to engage and it can be inappropriate to offer services until life has stabilised suitably, yes?
- A. That's correct. If the child doesn't want to engage there's - it's a non-starter.
- Q. And then you explain how a change of social worker can make a difference?
- A. Yes.
- D** Q. As personalities can clash. But most of the time you don't believe it does make a difference?
- A. Yes.
- Q. But a child can blame the social worker for things that are going wrong in their life?
- A. Yes.
- E** Q. In [Person A1]'s case, she was confused and did not know what she wanted in her life and was aggressive with anyone that worked with her?
- A. Yes.
- Q. All right. And then you explain what you have done about the removal of [Person
- F** A1]'s daughter over the page, and you explain, "This made her resentful and resistant to working with the local authority. I probably took this anger out on social workers".
- A. Yes, very much so.
- Q. And during this time, next paragraph, she - [Person A1] had a number of short term tenancies?
- G** A. Yes.
- Q. Now was it the case that the type of accommodation that [Person A1] had was relevant to whether or not she would have [Person S] returned or did [Person A1] perceive that?
- A. What do you mean exactly?
- H**

- A** Q. Was it relevant whether or not she could - what sort of home she had in terms of the view social services would take about returning [Person S] to her care, was that an issue for [Location B1] as far as you can recall?
- A. Once the child was removed, no, I mean it was mainly what was best for [Person A1]
- B** in terms of preparing her for independence because, obviously, the court process and getting the child returned was quite - would have been quite lengthy at the time. So it was trying to get - put [Person A1] in the best position possible to get her child back.
- Q. And then in paragraph 22, second sentence, "The decision was taken to move her out of the area and place her with Care Management Solutions".
- C** A. Yes, Yes.
- Q. In Dewsbury?
- A. Yes.
- Q. You say, "I cannot recall specifically but child sexual exploitation concerns probably played a part in the decision to move her out of the area".
- D** A. Yes.
- Q. "Although there was not clear evidence that she had been involved in CSE".
- A. That's right.
- Q. Yes.
- A. Yes.
- E** Q. And she never spoke to me about it?
- A. No, she never.
- Q. And you - there was no information received from her mother about that type of behaviour?
- F** A. No, not that I can recall, no.
- Q. But, again, had you by that point - and I can take you to the references - received information about the concerns?
- A. Sorry?
- Q. Had you received information about concerns from others, however?
- G** A. Oh, there was - there was plenty of concerns in terms of the behaviours and obviously historical concerns, but we were passing information on to the police and obviously it wasn't being acted on. So, but ---
- Q. Say that again, you were passing?
- A. Well, we were passing ---
- H** Q. Information was being passed on to the police?

- A**
- A. On to the police in strategy meetings, but, you know, it never got any further but - so we had to do our bit and move her out of area.
- Q. Right.
- A. In terms of protection.
- B**
- Q. And if she didn't have a child, we would have probably moved her further away, but she wouldn't have brought into the placement because otherwise she was still having contact with the child at the time.
- Q. So in August 2010, were you still working with [Person A1]?
- A. If that's what the records state, yes.
- C**
- Q. And could you just turn up [PERSON A7]/1 again, please.
- A. Which one am I going?
- Q. The file, sorry. Can I just return to the statement that I have.
- A. Page?
- Q. 139.
- D**
- A. Yes.
- Q. It looks as though this is August 2010 from the date in the middle of the page. It has your name at the bottom?
- A. Yes.
- E**
- Q. And, in fact, we can see that the reason for contact is for [REDACTED] at CMS?
- A. Right.
- Q. Who we will hear from shortly.
- A. Yes.
- Q. And she will give us this information?
- F**
- A. Yes.
- Q. But can you confirm there that the vulnerable victims unit?
- A. Yes.
- Q. And the police were involved with concerns as regards sexual exploitation of minors?
- A. Yes, yes.
- G**
- Q. And the police were going to be investigating that essentially?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Yes. And the concerns involved a number of girls but also [Person A]?
- A. Yes.
- Q. And you will have been aware of that?
- H**
- A. Yes.

- A**
- Q. At the time you made this statement?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Thank you. And then to paragraph 25, please. You say what you've just told said, "It's fair to say that, whilst we always placed information to the police, child sexual exploitation did not get the same response from the police then as it does now".
- B**
- A. That's correct.
- Q. Has that been your experience?
- A. Yes.
- Q. "I do not think it was treated as a priority at that time".
- C**
- A. That's correct.
- Q. "Generally, if the police knew where a child was, it was less of a concern for them than as if they were missing. Likewise, the police would not routinely attend professional meetings where childhood sexual exploitations were discussed whereas they do now".
- A. Yes.
- D**
- Q. But can you affirm ---
- A. Yes.
- Q. Confirm ---
- A. Yes, yes.
- Q. --- that to be the case with [Person A1], the police were attending?
- E**
- A. They were, yes.
- Q. Thank you. And you go on and say at the end of your statement that the only other option in terms of keeping a child safe from childhood exploitation was secure accommodation?
- F**
- A. That's right, yes.
- Q. And that's a significant step, the last resort, and there must be an immediate risk to the child?
- A. Yes, yes.
- Q. Secure placements are like gold dust and can be anywhere in the country?
- G**
- A. That's correct.
- Q. Since you made this statement to Berrymans Solicitors, have you ever been asked to give evidence about it?
- A. No.
- Q. Or have you had any further contact from them?
- H**
- A. No.

A Q. Whatsoever?
A. No further contact whatsoever.
MS MELLY: Thank you very much. Sorry, does your Honour have any questions?
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: [Person YY2], do we know at all, using this witness for general

B purposes, Mr Wilson ---
MR WILSON: Yes.
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: --- do we know at all whether it was ever thought to put [Person A1] into secure accommodation? Do we know that or was it just a non-starter?

A. I don't think she met the criteria.

C Q. Right, OK.
A. I don't think she - immediate risk in terms of her life.
Q. Yes.
A. As a criteria.

Q. Yes.

D A. If I can remember rightly.
Q. To life?
A. Yes, I don't think she met the criteria.
MR WILSON: Now we know - we may be moving away from social workers soon, so let

E me just clarify my understanding. You say - you talk about a latecomer into care and we know that [Person A1] was - was she 13 or 14?
MS MELLY: 14, certainly when she was at a care home.
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Just early - it was early 14s, early 08 she's in [Location B1].
A. Yes.

F Q. Is that your definition of a latecomer?
A. Yes, it is, yes.
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: OK. Well, we know all about the care home, but thank you, Mr Moulson, for the line. If [Person S] is born July 09?
MR MOULSON: Yes.

G JUDGE DURHAM HALL: That's for sure, isn't it?
MR MOULSON: It is.
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: So she was pregnant late 08.
A. Yes.

H JUDGE DURHAM HALL: If things you - as they work out usually, OK. And that child was given into the care of mum, is that right?

A MR MOULSON: Yes.
MS MELLY: Initial ---
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Temporarily?
MS MELLY: In - sorry.

B JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Initially.
MS MELLY: Initially, with [Person A1]. Initially, with [Person A1].
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Initially, [Person A1], then into - and then into [Person A1]'s mum's care.
MR MOULSON: Yes.

C MS MELLY: Yes.
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Not for us to comment, good plan, good idea or not. But, sadly, the child was then adopted.
MR MOULSON: Later free for adoption, your Honour, yes, quite so.
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: So gone. I mean, not gone but lost to [Person A1].

D MR MOULSON: From the immediate family.
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: All right.
MR MOULSON: Yes.
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: And you make one comment, the only comment I wish to consider with you. In that statement, and we understand the - obviously, the circumstances of that defence solicitor and all that, civil defence, paragraph 20, the removal of her child was probably just another endorsement to her that she was a failure, is that - what does that mean?

E A. Well, for a lot of children that come into care they're sort of made to feel guilty, rejected, unwanted, unloved and the fact that the child was removed would just sort of

F reinforce the negative thinking patterns that she already had of herself that she wasn't in a position to look after her child.
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: I see, OK. Well, thank you very much for coming. Anything arising, Mr Moulson?
MR MOULSON: No, your Honour.

G JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Nobody, no, good, thank you. Much obliged for your time. Thank you, [Person YY2].
WITNESS: Thank you.
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Thank you.
(The witness withdrew).

H MS MELLY: [Person G], please.

A JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Thank you.

MS MELLY: One - sorry, 53, I 53.

[PERSON G], Sworn

Examined in-chief by MS MELLY

B Q. Your full name, please?

A. [Person G1] Maureen Earley.

Q. Thank you. We might have to ask you to keep your voice up from time to time, OK.
In fact, are you struggling today?

A. A bit, yes.

C Q. All right. Well, I'll just have to repeat back if necessary, thank you.

A. OK.

Q. You know we're dealing with a case involving [Person A]?

A. Yes.

D Q. And we know that for a period of time [Person A] lived at Care Management Solutions, is that right?

A. Yes.

Q. And that was an organisation, was it, that you worked for?

A. Yes.

E Q. In terms of where it was, please, the general area that [Person A1] was living at, please?

A. [Location G], Dewsbury.

Q. [Location G], Dewsbury?

A. Yes.

F Q. And in what capacity were you working then, please?

A. I was a support worker.

Q. And did you specifically have a role to play with [Person A1] or were you a support worker to all of the young people?

A. All of them. I wasn't her key worker.

G Q. All right. And just help us a little bit with understanding what sort of accommodation this is. Was it independent sort of did they have their own kitchen or?

A. It was a care home, a communal kitchen, communal lounge and then individual bedrooms.

Q. Was it just girls that were placed there or boys - were boys there as well?

H A. There were only ever girls.

- A**
- Q. And is it right that they ranged between 16 and 18 years of age?
- A. Yes.
- Q. And, essentially, it was one large sort of house, is that correct?
- A. Yes.
- B**
- Q. Thank you. And would you log incidents that happened in terms of the CMS records?
- A. Yes, everything was logged.
- Q. OK, we'll deal with the (inaudible) regards the records perhaps in due course, but let me - help me, please, at the time that [Person A1] was there at CMS, would she have a normal up in the morning, awake during the day, sleep at night routine?
- C**
- A. No.
- Q. Just explain [Person A1]'s routine then?
- A. [Person A1] slept all day and went out late at night.
- Q. Then, when you say she went out late at night, what sort of times would she be going out?
- D**
- A. 11.30, 12.00.
- Q. To start going out?
- A. Yes.
- Q. OK. And how did she spend a period of time before she went out?
- A. Getting ready, getting dressed up.
- E**
- Q. Just pause there for a minute. Getting ready, getting dressed up, I mean was that a quick brush of the hair and?
- A. No, no, this were full make-up, her hair looked nice, taking pride in her appearance.
- Q. And how long would she take, roughly? I mean was it a long time, a short time to get ready?
- F**
- A. She'd spend quite a long time.
- Q. And she'd go out at 11.00 or 12.00, what time would she be coming back?
- A. Maybe the following morning. I was never at work when she returned because I worked the nights.
- G**
- Q. I should have asked you that, [Person G3]. Can you help us with that then, so were you awake working at nights at the property?
- A. Yes, I worked the night shifts.
- Q. OK. So what time did you stop?
- A. There was three shifts, so I either started at 8 pm, 9.00 or 10.00.
- H**
- Q. Right. And what time would you stop then?

- A**
- A. Oh, 5.00, 6.00, 7.00.
- Q. OK. So you'd be leaving the property - you'd be leaving work at 5.00, 6.00, 7.00 in the morning?
- A. Yes.
- B**
- Q. And would [Person A1] normally be back by that time?
- A. No.
- Q. Right. And would you ask her when you saw her on your next shift then where she'd been and what she'd been doing?
- A. She used to say things like, "I've just been cruising with my friends", or she - at the beginning she didn't really say that much.
- C**
- Q. All right. Now when she wasn't back at night, she was still in care but over 16, did you have to report her missing to anybody?
- A. Yes, first of all we had to phone social services and then we had to report her missing to the police.
- D**
- Q. All right. And did that always stay the same in terms of the interest when you reported the [Person A1] missing?
- A. No, we got told to stop doing it.
- Q. Stop doing what?
- A. Stop reporting her missing.
- E**
- Q. To social services or to the police?
- A. Social services told us to stop reporting her missing to the police and the police were no longer interested.
- Q. Right. Did they give you an explanation for that?
- F**
- A. It were just, "This is what she does" kind of thing. They weren't interested. It was like she always came back so don't bother us with it.
- Q. OK. Now I just want to ask you about her mobile telephone use, please; would you see her on her mobile phone?
- A. Constantly.
- G**
- Q. What, in terms of her making calls or people making calls to her?
- A. Both ways.
- Q. And what - did you ever hear what she was saying?
- A. Usually, it were, "What time are you picking me up?" "Bring me some cigarettes". It were different people that she spoke to.
- H**
- Q. Different people. Were they men, women?

- A**
- A. Asian men.
- MS MELLY: Now just before we get onto ---
- JUDGE DURHAM HALL: She's going to be asked, surely, how she knows that; can you clarify that, is that all right?
- B**
- MS MELLY: Thank you.
- JUDGE DURHAM HALL: At this stage.
- MS MELLY: How would you be able to form that opinion and form that view, please, of who it was on the phone?
- A. Because I'd ask her and she'd tell me.
- C**
- Q. Would she use the phrase, "It's Asian men", or would she tell you names?
- A. The one that I always remember was Sid.
- Q. And in what context would she use - would [Person A1] use the name, Sid, what would she say?
- A. Like he was her boyfriend like she were really close to him.
- D**
- Q. Is that what she would tell you?
- A. Yes.
- Q. And did she use his name once or more than once?
- A. Oh, all the time.
- E**
- Q. Now you've given us that name of Sid in the context of me asking you questions about how you knew it was an - how you knew it was Asian males. Sid could be a western name?
- A. No, she told me his real name as well.
- Q. Oh, right, OK.
- F**
- A. But all I remember, because she just called him Sid, that's the word, I always remember the name.
- Q. So when she gave you his name, and you told us you cannot remember that now.
- A. No, I can't remember that.
- Q. Was the real name an English name or an Asian name?
- G**
- A. Asian name.
- Q. Were other names mentioned by [Person A1]?
- A. Yes, but I can't remember them.
- Q. And were they other Asian males' names?
- A. Yes.
- H**

- A** Q. Now I was asking you about telephone use by [Person A1]. I think you said it was going non-stop or she was using it non-stop, a phrase like that; was that always her own mobile phone that she used?
- A. She had numerous mobile phones.
- B** Q. Do you know where they came from?
- A. No, because she didn't have the money to buy them.
- Q. What about your telephone, did you have that with you?
- A. I had a works mobile phone.
- Q. And would [Person A1] ever use that?
- C** A. I used to encourage her to use my work mobile phone because I felt that nobody were listening to me, that this young girl needed protecting. So I thought if I let her use my phone, I would then at least get the numbers that she were phoning and then they actually used to phone my mobile phone as well.
- Q. When you say, "They used to phone my mobile phone", who do you mean?
- D** A. Sometimes she'd phone and say, "This isn't my phone but can you phone me back".
- Q. Yes.
- A. So then I'd get both their numbers both ways.
- Q. Yes. I just want to be just - stating the obvious really, but when you were saying, "They" would call you back, who - are you talking about receiving calls from men, women?
- E** A. Men.
- Q. Right. Always the same man, different men?
- A. As I recall, it was usually Sid.
- Q. Right. You told us that Sid had been mentioned more than once, how regularly during this period of time would his name be mentioned?
- F** A. His name was always mentioned.
- Q. By?
- A. By [Person A1].
- Q. And, again, can you give us some examples of how - in what context, what she would be saying?
- G** A. On the phone?
- Q. No, about Sid to you.
- A. She spoke very highly of him. To me, she told me how old he were, but I can't really remember that. But it just wasn't right that a young girl was having these kind of feelings for
- H** an older man.

- A**
- Q. So she told you how old he was but you can't recall that now?
- A. No.
- Q. Do you recall your reaction to hearing his age?
- A. Yes, because I spoke to her about it.
- B**
- Q. And what did you say to her?
- A. I just couldn't under - well, I told her I didn't understand what an older man wanted with a young girl.
- Q. Now in terms of other people - well, you told us that she would tell you that she'd go cruising, did she ever tell you what address or whose home she was at?
- C**
- A. No.
- Q. Did she speak of seeing just one person when she went out or more than one?
- A. No, there were more than one.
- Q. In terms of giving you information about any other men who would be present, can you help us with that even if not as regards their names but other information?
- D**
- A. I remember her saying that there was like an uncle and a nephew.
- Q. And where would they - uncle and nephew, did she give you the context?
- A. The people that she was associating with, the men, there was an uncle and a nephew.
- Q. All right, thank you. Now you've told us that you didn't always see [Person A1] when she came back?
- E**
- A. No.
- Q. But would you see her the next day or the day after that from a night out?
- A. Sometimes, she were out for days.
- Q. Did you ever ask her if she had been drinking when she was out?
- F**
- A. Yes.
- Q. Now explain what would be said about that, please?
- A. She were quite - she were quite open and I always remember Jack Daniels, her stating that she drank Jack Daniels.
- JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Jack Daniels is American?
- G**
- MS MELLY: A bourbon, I believe, yes, or a whisky.
- JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Whisky.
- A. A whisky.
- JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Mr Moulson doesn't know, but I think others do.
- MS MELLY: No, he doesn't know. Did you ask where she'd got that from, Jack Daniels?
- H**
- A. The men that she were with had provided it.

- A**
- Q. That's what she's told you, did you ever see any evidence of her drinking?
- A. No.
- Q. What about in terms of how she was when you saw her, did you ever see her under?
- A. Sometimes she looked terrible.
- B**
- Q. What do you mean by that?
- A. I think sometimes she looked like she'd been under the influence of some substance and she just - oh, how can I - rough.
- JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Ms Melly, what dates approx. are we talking about, how old would [Person A3] - you'll deal with that, I suspect.
- C**
- MS MELLY: She was 16 at this time, is that right?
- A. Yes.
- JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Because that was the ---
- MS MELLY: Thank you.
- JUDGE DURHAM HALL: --- limit for the home, wasn't it, 16 plus, yes.
- D**
- MS MELLY: That's right. And you've mentioned substances.
- A. Yes.
- Q. What do you mean by that, please?
- A. It was cocaine.
- Q. And how do you know that, please?
- E**
- A. Because she were just - she were open. She used to say a lot of things for shock value that she'd - she wouldn't hide it and she'd just blatantly tell you.
- Q. So what sort of things would she tell you about the cocaine?
- A. "I've been off my head. I've had so much cocaine", and then obviously the drinking
- F**
- as well.
- Q. And did you ask her where she'd got the cocaine from?
- A. Friends, usually, who she'd been out with, the men.
- Q. I was going to ask you that, because if you talk about friends did she mention being out with females?
- G**
- A. No, never. She made a friendship for a very short time with another young girl that lived in the home, but that broke down. I never heard her speak about any female friends.
- Q. And during this period of time you say you never met - heard her mention female friends, do we understand that this is the period of time when the child's been removed?
- A. Her child had been removed. I think ---
- H**
- Q. And how was ---

- A**
- A. Sorry. I think the child lived with her mother or her grandmother, as far as I can remember.
- Q. And now you've mentioned [Person A1] talking about a man called Sid?
- A. Yes.
- B**
- Q. And you've also said that, "It felt like no one was listening to me"?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Listening to you about what?
- A. I were reporting and telling people, documenting it, that I thought this young girl was in danger and I thought she were being groomed.
- C**
- Q. Now did you ever have any contact - firstly, I just mean speaking to - with any gentleman called Sid?
- A. Yes.
- Q. And was that face to face or ---
- A. Both.
- D**
- Q. OK. And which was first, do you know?
- A. The phone call.
- Q. The phone call. Was that the phone call to your phone?
- A. Yes.
- E**
- Q. And what was said, please?
- A. He spoke to [Person A1] and then I asked if I could speak to him.
- Q. Right, just pause there for a moment. Now why was it that you wanted to speak to him, please?
- A. Because at that point I'd never had a conversation with him and to me I was trying to get little bits of evidence together because I was really concerned at that point that something was going to happen to her. So at least if I had little bits of information and anything did, I could come forward with this because at that point nobody were listening.
- F**
- Q. Thank you. So tell us about the phone call, please?
- A. It were - he told me that I sounded sexy on the phone and he told me he were coming to pick [Person A1] up.
- G**
- Q. Right, just pause there for a moment. So [Person A1] had spoken to him?
- A. Yes.
- Q. And then did [Person A1] tell him that you wanted to speak to him?
- A. Yes. And he was fine with that. Well, she passed the phone to me.
- H**
- Q. And was there - was he told who you were, that you were a worker at CMS?

- A**
- A. Yes, yes.
- Q. And just in dealing with the order then, was he told that and then you spoke to him?
- A. He knew by the phone.
- Q. Right. So what I'm trying to get at is did he know that at the point you say that he
- B** said you sound sexy?
- A. I presume so, I don't - yes, I think so. I'm not hundred per cent on that.
- Q. OK. And did you ask him who it was ---
- A. Yes.
- Q. --- that you were speaking to?
- C**
- A. Yes.
- Q. So what did you say to him?
- A. I asked who I was speaking to.
- Q. Yes.
- A. And he said Sid.
- D**
- Q. And was that the first thing that you said to him, did you establish that first?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Right. So does the comment about "sexy" come after that?
- A. Yes, yes.
- Q. And then he said - what did you say to that, please?
- E**
- A. I just brushed that off. Because I couldn't - he was coming to see her no matter what, and she was going to leave - we could not restrain [Person A1] to not leave that building. She was going to go, so at that point I had to make him feel and for [Person A1] to feel that everything was OK, that everything was fine, because I wanted to meet him.
- F**
- Q. Right. What did you hope to achieve, what did you want to do?
- A. I wanted his registration number.
- Q. So you were essentially fine with him on the phone. He told you he was coming over to get [Person A1]?
- A. Yes.
- G**
- Q. And so was it the same night then?
- A. Yes.
- Q. That you then meet him?
- A. Yes.
- Q. He came to see CMS?
- H**
- A. Yes.

- A**
- Q. And how would ---
- A. He pulled up out ---
- Q. Sorry.
- A. He pulled up outside and [Person A1] told me he were here.
- B**
- Q. Do you remember the vehicle?
- A. No.
- Q. Did he come inside CMS or did you go outside?
- A. Oh, no. No, I went straight outside. There was two of us working that night, so we both agreed that one would get the first half of the reg and the other one would get the other
- C**
- half of the reg.
- Q. Who were you working with?
- A. A lady called [REDACTED].
- Q. And what sort of time of night or day was this?
- A. Well, I think about the usual time she went out, about half past 11, but I'm not
- D**
- hundred per cent on that. I know it was night because I were working the night shift.
- Q. So did you and your colleague go outside?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Did you speak to him?
- A. Yes, yes, I spoke to him. He was very nice. I found him a bit overly nice, a little bit
- E**
- creepy.
- Q. Was [Person A1] present?
- A. I don't think [Person A1] came out straight away. I think she came out afterwards.
- Q. Did he have anything with him?
- A. Cigarettes.
- F**
- Q. Who were they for?
- A. [Person A1].
- Q. How do you know that?
- A. Because he passed her them.
- G**
- Q. Can you describe the man that you met?
- A. Asian, stocky, late 20s I think.
- Q. Did he use his name?
- A. Yes, he introduced himself to me.
- Q. As?
- H**
- A. Sid.

- A**
- Q. Thank you. And did you then speak to him?
- A. I asked him what interest he had in a young girl.
- Q. Pause there. What was his response?
- A. He responded by saying that we're - "We're just friends".
- B**
- Q. Was anything else said?
- A. He asked me things like was I married, just personal questions.
- Q. Did you answer them and engage with him?
- A. No.
- Q. Now were you at that stage ever asked to identify the man from any procedures or
- C** parades or anything like that in terms of identification of the man?
- A. No.
- Q. And what about the registration and the phone number of the vehicle?
- A. Everything was all documented on the spreadsheets that we had for each child.
- Q. And, following that meeting with Sid, did [Person A1] leave CMS with him?
- D**
- A. Yes.
- Q. Was that the only occasion that you met him?
- A. That I met him, yes.
- Q. You paused there, were there other occasions when you spoke to him or not?
- A. I'm not hundred per cent on that.
- E**
- Q. Thank you. Now just in terms of [Person A1]'s movements, please, you've told us that [Person A1] would leave, come back in the early hours, sometimes not for I think you said days?
- A. Yes.
- F**
- Q. Would you ever see her or have to meet her outside of CMS?
- A. Yes, I was once working the night and she phoned me, she were crying and I drove to Bradford and picked her up outside, well, the car park at the back of Bradford Ice Skating Rink.
- Q. Just pause there, please. The night shift, was it the - can you help us with the time or?
- G**
- A. Early hours of the morning; we're talking after 12.00.
- Q. Now you said she was crying, was that on the telephone?
- A. Yes.
- Q. And you went to pick her up?
- A. Yes.
- H**
- Q. Did she tell you why she was crying?

- A**
- A. No. She were frightened. She laid down on my backseat. She didn't sit in the front. She laid down on the backseat.
- Q. Did she tell you why?
- A. No.
- B**
- Q. Did she ask to pick you up - did she ask you to pick her up on other occasions?
- A. Yes, but I can't - I can't - I know she did because I got told to stop picking her up.
- Q. Just pause there. Who told you to stop picking her up?
- A. My manager at the time.
- Q. And then did you have to stop?
- C**
- A. Yes.
- Q. How did you feel about that rule?
- A. How did I what, sorry?
- Q. What was your attitude to your instruction from your management about not being able to pick her up?
- D**
- A. I think it were disgusting. It were disgusting all the way round. She were just bothered because she were having to pay petrol.
- Q. And when you say, "She", that was the - is that the manager?
- A. That was the owner.
- Q. And after a period of time at CMS, and we'll deal with the dates in a different way, did [Person A1] move into sort of more independent living accommodation?
- E**
- A. Yes.
- Q. Was that near CMS?
- A. Was it what, sorry?
- Q. Was it nearby CMS?
- F**
- A. Yes, it were just at the top of the road. It was on [Location E1].
- JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Sorry, what was the question again, Ms Melly, yes?
- MS MELLY: Sorry, [Person A1] moves from CMS.
- JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Yes.
- G**
- MS MELLY: And she moves just to the top of the road into independent living. So given the proximity to CMS, did you ever see her after she had moved into independent living?
- A. Yes, I - when I was working the night we had to do spot checks on the young people that were in independent living.
- Q. And did you take part in those spot checks on [Person A1]?
- H**
- A. Yes.

- A** Q. And what happened, please, can you describe the scene that you used to see when you turned up at [Person A1]'s property without, presumably, her - the nature of the spot check probably means that she had ---
- A. She didn't ---
- B** Q. --- no idea you were coming?
- A. No. More so with [Person A1], I really varied the time. It could even have been 4 o'clock in the morning. It could have been any time. Where [Person A1] lived, the main window, the front room window was waist high and there was no path, so you walked straight past the big window. So when it's dark and the light is on inside you can see
- C** everything. So I used to do the spot check. I never entered the house not while I were lone working. There were men in the house.
- Q. Right, pause there. You never entered the house?
- A. No.
- D** Q. And what was the reason - would you normally enter a house on a spot check?
- A. Only if I knew the house was empty.
- Q. Right. But you say that you never entered the house here?
- A. No, because as I walked past the window, the window started at my waist.
- Q. Yes.
- E** A. It were a large window and I was as far from here to there, looking in the window, the lights were on and I can see the full room full of Asian men.
- Q. Right, pause there. Can you give us - well, how many times have you turned up to do a spot check and there's been that sort of scene?
- A. More often than not. Quite a few times. I'd say out of 10 probably eight.
- F** Q. Right. So when you say, "Full", what sort of numbers of how many men?
- A. About around seven, eight.
- Q. And you used the term, "Men", can you age them?
- A. Yes, I know - there was one that was younger and I remember that because I knew his brother.
- G** Q. One that was younger?
- A. Yes.
- Q. What about the others?
- A. No, they were men.
- H** Q. Is that your best recollection? I don't want to push you on it, if you can't remember clearly.

A A. Well, they wasn't young boys, you know 16, 17, 18. These were men that was closer to my age than her age.

Q. Were there ever other women there or girls there?

A. No, I never saw another ...

B Q. Could you ever see what was going on, what they would be doing?

A. It were only a second walk just to knock, because I used to knock to say, "Get them out of the house, I'm coming back".

Q. Right.

A. So it was only a ...

C Q. And would you do that then, would you come back a bit later and check that the men had gone?

A. Yes.

Q. And would you then, if they had gone, go into the property and see [Person A1]?

A. Well, yes.

D Q. And would you then - you've told us what your concerns were, did you discuss them with [Person A1]?

A. Yes, [Person A1] - [Person A1] just didn't understand where I was coming from. She protected them as well. She couldn't see no wrong. And I think it were more that she liked that - she wanted and she craved that love and attention. Her child had been taken. She was in care and she were very good at putting her front up were [Person A1]. She could come across as quite hard but she weren't. Once you got to know her, she wasn't. And I think she just wanted that: something, somebody. And I think at that point that's what she found in these men.

E Q. Did she ever disclose to you any sexual offences?

A. No.

MS MELLY: Thank you very much.

Cross-examined by MR MOULSON

F Q. Can you just help us with some timings first, please. Do you have a timeline there with you? I think it may be behind you, a bundle of documents like this. Page 26, please, ladies and gentlemen, thank you. Bottom centre, it's those page numbers at the very base of the page. Could you go to 26, please. Can you see at the very top of the page, it says, "File name", do you have that? At the top centre of the page, it says, "File name"?

A. No, where am I looking?

G Q. The title, "File name", being ---

- A**
- A. Oh, yes, yes, yes, sorry.
- Q. Yes, thank you. Not at all. If you can try and turn and face the jury, please, as well, I'm sorry. We won't be with this document for long. And if you come down from the words, "File name", do you see a box with, "[Location G], Dewsbury", yes?
- B**
- A. Yes.
- Q. Then the date, 7th of June 2010?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Is that the date you would have started, if I can use the expression, to care for [Person A1]?
- C**
- A. I really couldn't tell you.
- Q. Right. I think that's maybe the first entry we have for [Location G], Dewsbury. We know that [Person A1] was born on the 9th of July of 1993, so at that point she would have been a month short of her 17th birthday, does that help clarify the date when you started working with her?
- D**
- A. No.
- Q. No. Is it about ---
- A. I have no timescale.
- Q. Is it about right?
- A. If I said yes I'd be lying, I really ---
- E**
- Q. All right, all right. In terms of the duration for which you cared for her - forgive me, I think that document that can be put to the side now, thank you very much. The duration that you cared for her, was that about a 12 month period?
- A. Yes, it was - it wasn't - maybe. I don't know.
- F**
- Q. Were you caring for her, for example, when she had her 18th birthday?
- A. I don't actually know that neither.
- Q. All right. You were caring for her when she was at [Location G] and then a further address, weren't you?
- A. Yes.
- G**
- Q. Yes, thank you. How often would you see her over that period?
- A. Which period, sorry?
- Q. When she was at [Location G].
- A. I think I worked two, three nights a week, so.
- Q. Right.
- H**

- A** A. Sometimes I didn't see her because sometimes she were out. Sometimes she'd gone, but ...
- Q. All right. And then when she was at the later address you spot check that address on about eight or 10 occasions, is that right?
- B** A. Quite - yes, quite a few.
- Q. Yes. And you would have seen her on further occasions other than the spot checks, wouldn't you, at that time when she was living at that later address?
- A. No.
- MR MOULSON: No. So eight to 10 times then, yes?
- C** JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Can I just, you may be right, is it eight out of 10 times she did a spot check she saw X, Y and Z?
- MR MOULSON: The Asian men, and so I ---
- JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Or is it only eight out of 10 times you did a spot ---
- D** A. I were just giving it as an average that the majority of the time I actually went there were, not the fact that I went eight times.
- MR MOULSON: Yes. Ah, forgive me, I thought you meant eight times out of a total of 10.
- A. No, it were just - no, I would just say more often than not.
- Q. Right. So your visits to her were more frequent than 10, were they, at the later address?
- E** A. They were - well, sometimes it could have been three in a night.
- Q. Right.
- A. If she didn't get rid of who were in the house.
- Q. Right, all right. So frequent contact with her over the period over which you cared for her, is that right?
- F** A. Yes.
- Q. Yes, thank you. And on one occasion, you made reference, is this right, to a man picking her up who gave you the name Sid, is that right?
- A. Yes.
- G** Q. Thank you. And you described him in a statement you made to the police, amongst other terms of description, as having short hair and mid to late 20s, is that right?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Thank you. She mentioned other Asian names to you, is that right?
- A. She used other Asian names, yes.
- H** Q. Yes. And she presented to you as wanting to see these men, didn't she?

- A**
- A. Sometimes, not all the time.
- Q. All right. Throughout the course of your care for her, she never complained of rape by any of them, did she?
- A. No.
- B**
- Q. Or any adverse sexual contact with them?
- A. No.
- Q. Or that any of them sent her out to work as a prostitute?
- A. No.
- Q. Or to get drugs for them?
- C**
- A. No.
- Q. Or to perform any sexual favours for any individual?
- A. No.
- Q. You never saw her injured, did you?
- A. No, I didn't.
- D**
- Q. You knew that she had a mobile telephone, didn't you?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Did you ever see a list of contacts from that phone or a written list of contacts?
- A. No.
- E**
- Q. By her. Were you ever aware that there was more than one man called Sid in that telephone?
- A. No.
- Q. No, thank you. Just about, forgive me, the arrival of the man Sid at the home and the obtaining of the registration number of that vehicle, can you remember if that vehicle was a silver car?
- F**
- A. Oh, I have no idea.
- Q. No idea of the colour at all?
- A. It's been a long time, I don't know.
- Q. Thank you. Moving to the spot checks at the later address, yes.
- G**
- A. Yes.
- Q. If you'd seen the man called Sid, the man who arrived at the home, at that address on those spot checks, you would have put that in your statement to the police, wouldn't you?
- A. Yes. I didn't stand and gawp at the window.
- H**
- Q. No. But if you'd seen him there, you would have mentioned that to the police, wouldn't you?

A

A. I would.

Q. And there's no mention of him being there in your statement, is there?

A. No.

MR MOULSON: Thank you very much indeed. Nothing further.

B

Cross-examined by MR WILSON

Q. Can I just again you to look at this timeline. When you did (inaudible) of checks in relation to independent living, can you remember which addresses or address that was at?

Because she went to more than one, didn't she?

A. The ones I did the spot check on?

C

Q. Yes (inaudible) address, where did you - which homes or home or homes?

A. I only went to one.

Q. I see. Can you remember which one it was?

A. Just off [Location E1].

D

Q. All right. And do you remember when you last had any dealings with her?

A. When I left, when she left. I've no idea.

Q. All right. Well, we know she went to [Location E1]. That is on page 32 of the timeline, 24th of November 2010. And over the page we know that she moved on four months or so later to a different address in [REDACTED] Batley, at the end of the March the following year. Now had you still contact with her by then?

E

A. No. [Location E1] was the last I'd seen of [Person A1].

Q. So can you - we see she was at [Location E1] from late November to late March, can you remember if you saw her at all after Christmas 2010 or was it in the initial weeks when you would have had contact there?

F

A. I don't know.

Q. So you never saw her after she moved to [REDACTED], do I understand your answer correctly?

A. I don't ever remember her living on [REDACTED] so at that point I don't know if - no, I can't - no, I don't remember [REDACTED], just [Location E1].

G

Q. So just concentrating on [Location E1], perhaps how many times do you think you saw her on [Location E1]?

A. On my spot checks?

Q. Yes, or for whatever reason you said you'd go there and see her?

A. Sorry, I can't hear you.

H

A Q. How many times did you go there into the - her home at [Location E1] and speak to her for whatever reason?

A. I don't know. A handful of times maybe, I don't - the spot check, you just looked round, made sure they were OK and you left. That were it. It weren't for a big conversation or a chat or - it was just to make sure that they were safe and in the house.

B Q. And you - is this right then that you can't remember at all when those handful of visits were in relation to that sort of four month period, November to March?

A. No.

C Q. Is it likely to have been nearer the beginning when it was all new, newer, do you think, these visits?

A. When it was newer?

Q. Well, newer to her, (inaudible) her?

A. Are you asking me if I did more visits at the beginning?

Q. Yes.

D A. No, it were consistent whenever I did the nights that she got spot checked.

MR MOULSON: All right. So it was more to do with events rather than strategy. All right, that's probably as far as we can take it, thank you very much.

MR IQBAL: No, thank you, your Honour.

Re-examined by MS MELLY

E Q. Just two, a couple of very brief points, please. You've agreed, as you told me, that [Person A1] had never described rape or sexual abuse or so forth to you, but was she forthcoming generally about what she had been doing on those nights out and where she'd been?

F A. She wouldn't ---

Q. And how she'd spent her time?

A. She would have never have out - like speaking about being vulnerable, that was not - that was not [Person A1]. [Person A1]'s - there was a front, like I said. I don't think she'd have divulged that. And she definite - she didn't to me.

G Q. And then you were being asked about visits and so forth and I just want to clarify something with you. You talked and agreed about there being a handful of occasions?

A. Yes.

H Q. OK. Are you saying that there was only a handful of times when you went to her independent living property or that there were a handful of times when you went in and had a proper conversation with [Person A1]?

A A. There was only a handful of times when I attended that there was nobody in the house so I could enter the house.

Q. Because I think what people just were just trying to check and it might be that you can or can't help us with this, you've talked about say on some nights you might have been at the property three times?

B A. Yes.

Q. Is it possible for you to give a very rough estimation of the number of occasions you will have ever gone to that property on [Location E1]?

A. Sorry, I don't understand.

C Q. So I think what people were trying to establish was how many times do you think you've ever gone up and glanced through the window or gone up to her property, roughly speaking? Are we just dealing with a handful of occasions or?

D A. Because I worked two, three nights a week, I went there two, three times and - a lot. I did go a lot because, like I say, sometimes I had to go back. I can't - do you know what, I don't know.

Q. No, all right, but that's very helpful, thank you. So your - you worked for two or three times a week and would you have done spot checks on that property?

A. Every time I was on shift.

E MS MELLY: Right, thank you.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Thank you very much. [Person G3], thank you so much for coming. Just to confirm, you were never a social worker, were you?

A. No.

F Q. Your history was volunteering, looking after adults, learning difficulties and then this eventually became a job, yes?

A. Yes.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Yes, good, so that's fine. OK, thank you very much indeed.

Thank you.

WITNESS: Thank you.

G (The witness withdrew)

MS MELLY: Would that be a convenient time?

H JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Yes, it would, I think, absolutely. I didn't want to interrupt this witness, obviously, to finish her. Can we have a break? I think some of us would appreciate it. I'll find out what's going to happen next this morning, but if we have our 15, 20 minutes, no rush. When you're ready, we'll start, OK. Thank you.

A

(The jury left court at 12.01)

[REDACTED]

B

[REDACTED]

C

[REDACTED]

D

[REDACTED]

E

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED], doesn't [REDACTED]

F

[REDACTED]

G

[REDACTED]

H

[REDACTED]

A

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

(Short adjournment)

B

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

C

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

D

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

E

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

F

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

G

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

H

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

A

[REDACTED]

B

[REDACTED]

C

[REDACTED]

D

[REDACTED]

E

[REDACTED]

F

(The jury entered court at 12.35)

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: One of the members of the jury, Ms Melly, has now finally had to give in and ask for the loop system.

MS MELLY: Yes.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Because some of us, I don't - not you necessarily, but aren't speaking - witnesses aren't speaking clearly.

G

MS MELLY: No.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: So it's very important that we do what we can.

MS MELLY: We have taken the precaution, we've listened again to the DVDs during the break. They are audible, but because of particular issues and the size of the courtroom and so

H

A forth we're having transcripts in case your Honour thinks that's appropriate once we get started.

B JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Sure. Not a bad idea. As long as we follow the rules - although there's a recent case I think yesterday or today, I don't think it really affects the basic rule, does it?

MS MELLY: No.

C JUDGE DURHAM HALL: So we'll look at that. Thank you, ladies and gentlemen. The loop system is for one of you coming. That little discussion there wasn't meant to be rude to you. It's just that I am already alive to the issue that the DVDs of [Person A1] may not be the quality you would expect in a big room. So we've ways of helping, so don't worry about that. Whoever needs the loop, it's coming. The loop is an amplification device. I can well understand that. Sorry for the delay. I had to deal with a little matter. Nobody's fault. On the contrary. It was brought to my attention, that there might be some inaccurate reporting going on in press, whether nationally or locally I really do not know. I just wish to emphasise to you that this happens in a case like this. People are talking about the case, aren't they, who aren't actually here listening to it and things get mixed up. It is so essential that you just basically ignore anything you hear and read and concentrate on the evidence not on third party reporting, OK, thank you. We're going to do a bit of this next last witness.

D MS MELLY: Yes.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Before we move to the DVDs this afternoon, right?

MS MELLY: That's exactly right, yes, thank you.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Yes.

E MS MELLY: So the next witness is [REDACTED], but I just wonder has the loop system come in and been set up?

USHER: Yes, it has.

MS MELLY: It is, thank you.

F JUDGE DURHAM HALL: okey-doke. I'm afraid we've limited quantities of them, so if anybody suddenly develops a hearing problem I may not be able to help, OK. But the point is we must all shout.

MS MELLY: Well, I'm not often accused of speaking too quietly.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: No.

MS MELLY: I 51, your Honour.

G [REDACTED], Affirmed
H Examined in-chief by MS MELLY

- A**
- Q. Is your full name, [REDACTED]?
- A. It is.
- Q. Ms [REDACTED]e, thank you very much. And you've made a statement dated July 2016, but it was dealing with circumstances from around 2010, is that right?
- B**
- A. It is.
- Q. Right. Because in 2010 you were working for Care Management Solutions, is that right?
- A. That's right.
- Q. The owner of that business is a lady or - she's passed away, [REDACTED]?
- C**
- A. Yes.
- Q. Is that right? And you started work there at around 2010?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Not shall we say as a qualified social worker, is that right?
- A. That's correct.
- D**
- Q. But your role there was essentially to provide support for the teenage girls who were living in the property?
- A. That's correct.
- Q. And I think you describe it as trying to give them some normality?
- A. That's correct.
- E**
- Q. Just like making it a normal home?
- A. Yes, basically preparing them for independent living.
- Q. Thank you very much. And so we all understand that [Person A] was a young person living in that property?
- F**
- A. Yes.
- Q. Did you have a specific role with [Person A]?
- A. I did become key worker for [Person A1].
- Q. Was that as soon as she arrived?
- A. No.
- G**
- Q. During the initial period or later on in her stay?
- A. Later on in her stay.
- Q. All right, thank you very much. I'm just checking everybody is able to hear you? All right, thank you very much. And we know that that property was at [Location G]?
- A. Yes.
- H**

- A** Q. Now as we understand it also, she was supposed to be sleeping at that property every night?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Did you work nights or days or a mixture?
- B** A. A mixture, mainly days but we did cover nights for holidays and sickness.
- Q. All right, thank you. So can you describe in general terms then what you could be observe as regards [Person A]'s pattern about being out?
- A. Yes, she used to be in mainly in the day time, mainly in bed during the daytime and usually go out late at night.
- C** Q. Late at night would be?
- A. Mainly - mainly weekends.
- Q. And when you say late at night in terms of the time?
- A. It's hard to remember that far back.
- Q. Certainly.
- D** A. But it was normally, if we were on the late shift we were usually on, well, 10 o'clock, so usually she'd have gone out before - to the later part of our shift, so probably around 9 - between 8.00 and 10.00.
- Q. All right, thank you. And getting back, please, when would she be getting back?
- E** A. It all depended. Quite often, she stayed out all night. If not, it was the early hours of the morning. It could vary.
- Q. And would this be on weekdays and weekends?
- A. Mainly weekends, but it could be at different times, yes.
- Q. And on the weekends would she still come back?
- F** A. Sometimes, but quite often she'd just not come back while the following week.
- Q. And seeing as that she was still technically, she's still a looked after child?
- A. Yes.
- Q. In children's services, what were you supposed to do when she was out and not returning?
- G** A. Tried to make contact with her.
- Q. Yes.
- A. But often [Person A1] wouldn't have a phone or she'd turn her phone off and we would report it to the police who would come out and take a missing person's report.
- Q. OK. And would they deal with that initially the police, a missing person's report, or?
- H** A. Sorry, how do you mean?

A Q. Well, when you rang them would they immediately deal with it as a missing person or would ---
A. Yes, they do put it ---
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Just a minute. Don't.

B UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Sorry.
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Don't do that.
UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (inaudible).
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Leave court. I'm terribly sorry.
UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Sorry, sir, sorry.

C JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Speaking over the public gallery whilst a witness is giving - is quite frankly remarkable.
UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I apologise.
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: By my standards, anyway. I'm sorry, I may be old-fashioned. I do apologise. Sorry to interrupt you.

D MS MELLY: Not at all.
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Where were we?
MS MELLY: Thank you very much.
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Sometimes out all weekend and not coming back until the next week, I got that bit.

E MS MELLY: Thank you. Then, we were dealing with the police reporting.
A. They'd always take the details over the phone.
Q. Yes.
A. But not necessarily would they come out straight away.

F Q. All right. And then you presumably have a further conversation, which is once she'd returned?
A. Yes, and they'd come out and see [Person A1].
Q. Right. And so was it a regular occurrence having police officers at CMS?
A. Yes, yes.

G Q. And would they be attending to speak to [Person A1]?
A. Yes, they did come out to speak to [Person A1].
Q. Now in terms of [Person A1] leaving CMS, how would she leave, would she go in a taxi or on foot?
A. She used to - she got picked up. She'd have phone calls to her phone and make

H arrangements for people to pick her up.

- A**
- Q. And would you see her make the phone calls?
- A. Yes.
- Q. And would you see the vehicles come and collect her?
- A. Yes.
- B**
- Q. Just dealing with it generally, would you take details of the vehicles?
- A. Yes.
- Q. If you could?
- A. Yes.
- Q. And record them?
- C**
- A. Yes.
- Q. Was it always the same vehicle?
- A. No.
- Q. Or different vehicles?
- A. Different vehicles. It could - it depended. And, obviously, we didn't always work the same shifts. We did occasional shifts, so.
- D**
- Q. And would you ever see the person coming to pick them up?
- A. No, where - where CMS was, it was on quite a main road and there was a junction straight opposite and they used to park on the junction straight opposite, so no. Sometimes we did use to go out, yes, and would glance at people, yes.
- E**
- Q. OK. So then just in terms - not asking for detailed descriptions of those glances, but could you see whether the person collecting [Person A1] was male or female?
- A. Yes, it were male.
- Q. And could you see their ethnicity?
- F**
- A. Asian men.
- Q. And in terms of their age, were they around - [Person A1] would be 16, 17 at the time
-
- A. It was older than [Person A1].
- Q. Thank you. Did [Person A1] ever give you names of individuals that she would be
- G**
- meeting?
- A. Yes.
- Q. What name?
- A. The only name that I can ever remember was Sid.
- Q. Right, pause there.
- H**
- A. And that was the only name.

- A**
- Q. Sorry, what was that?
- A. Sid, that is the only name that I can ever remember.
- Q. Do I take what you're saying is she gave you other names?
- A. Yes.
- B**
- Q. But now Sid is the one that you can remember?
- A. That's the only one that I can remember.
- Q. The other names that she gave you, you clearly can't remember them now?
- A. No.
- Q. But were they male or female names?
- C**
- A. Male names.
- Q. And were they Asian or western names?
- A. Asian names.
- Q. In what context did [Person A1] give you the name Sid, what would she say?
- D**
- A. She was quite open about talking about him. It was - it was just mainly with general conversation with [Person A1], it was hard to get her to talk about things so you used to get things in snippets. You know, you couldn't exactly approach her and - if you approached [Person A1] at that time and mentioned a name and tried to talk about incidents that she'd talked about, you had to wait for [Person A1] to come to you to talk to you about them situations, does that make sense?
- E**
- Q. Yes, but can I just understand that a little more. If you went, actually, and said that you've given us such and such a name, I want to now ask you who is that person or so forth or, you know, how old are they, what are you doing, what would [Person A1]'s response be if you dealt with her like that?
- F**
- A. I honestly can't remember how he was described.
- Q. Sorry, I think you're misunderstanding.
- A. Sorry.
- Q. What I'm trying to understand is you've told us that you didn't go and interrogate [Person A1]?
- G**
- A. Yes.
- Q. And I just want you to explain to the jury why that was and how [Person A1] would react if you had tried to get more detail from her?
- A. Right, sorry, I understand you now.
- Q. It's my fault.
- H**

- A**
- A. If we - the main time that we could get [Person A1] to talk was if we was in the car, we'd go for a drive and go shopping and [Person A1] would - I'm really sorry, I've totally forgotten what you've questioned.
- Q. No, that's all right, that's all right. I just want you to try and ex - you've already
- B**
- A. Yes.
- Q. So I just want you to explain why it was that you couldn't just sit down with [Person A1] and say: right, who were you meeting? Where were you going? How would [Person A1] react with you trying to get detail?
- C**
- A. If we'd have gone to her and actually said it how you've just said it to me, she would have just totally and utterly clammed up, not spoke to us, probably walked out, given us abuse and she could lose her temper at times.
- Q. Yes, OK, thank you.
- A. She wouldn't have gone for us. She never did go for us, but she could smash things in the property, throw things about and things like that.
- D**
- Q. OK. So you've told us that you would try and approach things in a different way?
- A. Yes.
- Q. OK. And so in that different way, let me ask you it in this way, where would she say generally she was going of an evening, what she was going to go and do?
- E**
- A. She wouldn't ever tell us where she was going or what she was going to do. It was after events that she had talked to us about things that had happened. She would never tell us, you know, her intentions of I'm going out to do things.
- Q. So, again, returning to this name of this person, Sid?
- F**
- A. Yes.
- Q. All right. Did she ever indicate that she'd been to that person's property?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Can you - again, can you explain that, please, in what context would she say that she was going there?
- G**
- A. She used to just say that people were her friends and that she used to go to meet up with other people there. She used to go with [Person B1] there.
- Q. Pause there. She used to meet up with other people there?
- A. Yes.
- Q. And where do you mean by "There"?
- H**

- A**
- A. From my recollection and obviously it is a long time ago that it was in the Allerton area.
- Q. Right. And whose address are you talking about?
- A. This is where she used to go and meet everybody.
- B**
- Q. And where did you understand Sid to live?
- A. Allerton from ---
- Q. Right, OK. So when you're saying that [Person A1] went to meet up with other people there?
- A. Yes.
- C**
- Q. Are you talking about Sid's house or somewhere else?
- A. I took it from what [Person A1] told us that it was Sid's house.
- Q. Right, thank you. And that she went with [Person B1] there, is that what you said?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Right. Is [Person B1] another girl who was in the care ---
- D**
- A. She wasn't with us.
- Q. No.
- A. But [Person A1] had, as far as I know, met her through the care system and was still in contact with her.
- E**
- Q. Thank you. Now you say that Sid is the only name that you can now remember?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Were all the names mentioned equally or was one name mentioned more than others by [Person A1]?
- A. No, it was mainly Sid that was mentioned by [Person A1].
- F**
- Q. Did Sid ever - sorry, did [Person A1] ever describe to you where Sid worked?
- A. No. She did to a colleague of mine, so we were all made aware of it that he worked at next in Bradford.
- Q. Did you ever go near what you understand to be Sid's address?
- A. I once went with another night member of staff to look for a property where we thought or not. All I can remember is going to Allerton, and I'm not from round this area so I don't know and I just remember coming down a long road with a really big bend, but we didn't actually attend any property, no.
- G**
- Q. And did you find [Person A1]?
- A. No.
- H**

A MS MELLY: All right. I'm going to move on to another topic, so I wonder if that's an appropriate time?

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: I think so, I think so. I know we're not going to finish this witness before lunch.

B MS MELLY: Yes.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: We won't be here very long after but it's right we have a break. OK, can we come back at, what, is 2.10 OK? To give everybody time to get out of the building and back. So see you at 2.10 give or take, OK. Thank you. If you'd like to go, ladies and gentlemen.

C (The jury left court at 12.55)

[REDACTED]

D [REDACTED]

E (Luncheon adjournment)

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Thank you, thank you. I think the person - who's Fahim Iqbal's client, Mr Dallas? I think the gentleman who was speaking over the partition is your dad?

MR DALLAS: Yes, he is.

F JUDGE DURHAM HALL: As long as it's not going to - I'm not going to exclude a dad from his son's trial.

MR DALLAS: He's been in touch with my solicitor. He's very apologetic. He had to leave for medical reasons and he was trying to catch his son's eye to tell him he was going. It was something like that.

G JUDGE DURHAM HALL: OK.

MR DALLAS: And he's horrified and apologetic and hopes that you will make some future allowance ---

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Yes, he is, he is.

MR DALLAS: Thank you, I'll communicate that to him.

H

A JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Yes. He's not the sort of person I am really concerned about, Mr Dallas.

MR DALLAS: No, it was a stupid thing to do.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: It was just an error of judgment, yes. Sorry to keep you. Yes,

B thank you.

(The jury entered court at 14.16)

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Thanks very much, thank you.

MS MELLY: Thank you. Ms ██████, I was asking you some questions about the gentleman called Sid that [Person A1] had spoken of.

C A. Yes.

Q. All right. Did you ever meet Sid?

A. No.

Q. Did you ever see him?

A. Of who I believed for him to be, yes, in a car.

D Q. In the car, all right. And were you able to see him well enough to describe him?

A. No, not now, no.

Q. Ethnicity?

A. Asian.

Q. Age?

E A. I would have said probably - a probably similar age to what I was.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Well, that really does cause a problem because we're going to have to ask. What ---

A. 20.

F Q. About 20?

A. I'm now 45.

Q. All right. I walked straight into that one, so all right.

A. All right.

Q. How - how old do you think was then?

G A. At the time in the ---

Q. At the time?

A. At the time in the late 30s, middle 30s, thank you.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Mid to late 30s, OK.

MS MELLY: Did [Person A1] always use that name for that particular gentleman or did she

H refer to him by any other names?

- A** A. I can only remember that name. There were other names and I cannot remember any other names.
- Q. Just to be clear, not names of other men but other names for the gentleman called Sid?
- A. No, that's the only name that I can remember.
- B** Q. And did she describe any specific incidents of being at Sid's house?
- A. There was one time that she described that she'd - that the police had been looking for her when she was out as a missing person and she said that he had hidden in a wardrobe and the police had been in and not found her and she thought it was really good that she'd been hid.
- C** Q. So the police were looking for her?
- A. Yes.
- Q. She'd not been found and, just to be clear, whose home was she saying she was at?
- A. It was the house in Allerton that she led us to believe was Sid's house.
- Q. And they hadn't, the police hadn't managed to locate that?
- D** A. No.
- Q. And in terms of how she was describing an incident such as that, did she find that serious or?
- A. No, she found it - she found it funny that she hadn't been found.
- E** Q. Were you aware of whether or not she was using drugs and alcohol during that period of time?
- A. Yes. [Person A1] was drinking, often came back under the influence of drink and drugs and quite openly told us that she'd take cocaine and M-CAT.
- Q. So drugs in the form of cocaine and M-CAT?
- F** A. Yes.
- Q. And you say when she came back, is that when she came back from these nights where she'd been missing?
- A. Yes, from the nights, yes.
- Q. And in terms of alcohol, would she tell you what she was drinking?
- G** A. As far as I can remember it used to be vodka that she used to, but as a young girl I think it was anything that she could get her hands on that she'd drink to go out.
- Q. And did you speak to her about using drugs and alcohol when she was out?
- A. Yes, at length often. [Person A1] saw nothing wrong in what she was doing. We tried - that were our job to try and make her realise that this wasn't normal and not to be
- H** doing it, but [Person A1] always thought that she was right and because when she was with

A the people that she was with they would give her alcohol and she would tell us they would give her drugs. She used to think that she'd be the one that was in control of it because she was getting what she wanted.

Q. Did she talk to you about whether or not she was sexually active in those situations?

B A. Yes. She used to say that she did have sex with people. She used to go to - she used to call them parties, but I'm not sure it was a party as what I think as a party. But that was [Person A1]'s words. And she would have sex with numerous people and be given drink and drugs to be able to do that.

Q. Just pause there, please. And was this information given to you just on one occasion

C by [Person A1] or was this the subject of repeated conversations that you had with her?

A. No, it wasn't just to me, obviously it was to all of us and we all had meetings every week regarding this and the same information used to be passed on to us all. We did attend meetings at Bradford on around about regarding the dangers that we all believed [Person A1] was putting herself in.

D Q. But in terms of what [Person A1] was saying to you.

A. Yes.

Q. Those conversations, were they sort of conversations talking about risks and dangers and so forth, were you having those conversations ---

E A. Yes.

Q. --- repeatedly?

A. Yes.

Q. And in terms of the locations where this took place, you mentioned parties or that [Person A1] would describe them as parties?

F A. Yes.

Q. You mentioned her going to this address in Allerton and her telling you about that, is that different to when the par - to the parties happening or is that the same?

A. Yes, she used to - she used to refer to any time she went out as a party.

Q. Right.

G A. That was her phrase. The other places that she did mention, she used to mention Etap Hotel in Bradford.

MS MELLY: Pause there.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Say again.

A. Etap Hotel.

H JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Etap, yes.

A A. Correct.
MS MELLY: Did she mention it in the context that she would be going there?
A. Yes.
Q. With other people or not?

B A. Yes.
Q. Yes. So she'd - you were about - it sounded like you were going to give us some other ---
A. Sorry ---
Q. Then, sorry, (inaudible) ---

C A. And the only other place that I can remember was the time that she went missing for quite a while and as I knew it was Birmingham.
Q. Right. So was the Etap Hotel something mentioned more than once?
A. I can't honestly remember that, but - I can't honestly remember.
Q. But in terms of going to Birmingham, was that specific?

D A. That was one event that sticks out in my mind.
Q. Did she tell you who was going to Birmingham with?
A. No, we didn't know that's where she was going.
Q. No, sorry, did she ever tell you who she'd been with then?

E A. Yes.
Q. And who did she say she'd been with?
A. She said that it was arranged and she was there with a lot of Asian men. She probably did mention their names, but all this time I can't remember any names.
MS MELLY: If I ask you have to your memory re - I just look over to Mr Moulson, otherwise I'll just take you to it if you want?

F JUDGE DURHAM HALL: No, Mr Moulson anticipates I'm bound to give permission.
MR MOULSON: Yes, of course.
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: For this.
MS MELLY: Thank you. Then, I'll just deal with it in this way. You made your statement -

G (inaudible) to hand, but sometime ago when things were - were things fresher in your mind at that time? Yes, you're nodding in agreement. You indicate in your statement previously that you remembered her going down to Birmingham with this Sid.
A. His name will have been mentioned to me, I'm - I've been through a really traumatic time over the last few months and I can honestly tell you at this moment in time I can't recall

H the name.

- A** JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Well, that's why we are refreshing your memory.
- A. I'm sorry.
- Q. Madam.
- A. Yes.
- B** Q. To put you out of your misery trying to remember. Your statement says, "I also remember her going down to Birmingham with this Sid". OK, that's what we're talking about.
- A. Yes.
- JUDGE DURHAM HALL: All right.
- C** MS MELLY: It's not a memory test, Ms [REDACTED] all right. Nobody is criticising you.
- A. Yes.
- Q. OK. And was that for a specific occasion? Perhaps if I just carry on if I ---
- A. Yes. It was for a wedding that she'd told us that was happening there. And, when [Person A1] came back, she did tell us that she'd had sex with numerous people while she was down there.
- D** Q. Did [Person A1] ever speak of having sexual intercourse with Sid?
- A. As far as I - yes, yes, she did tell me, yes, she did.
- Q. Can you recall how she was when she was speaking about it, happy, sad?
- A. No, she was happy. She was - she thought a lot about him and was happy about that at that time when she told me.
- E** Q. Thank you. And although you say that you told - she told you about drink or drugs, when you saw her come back from either being out overnight or say when she'd been away for a few days, how would she seem to you?
- A. You could tell she would - she'd been under the influence of substances, whether it be drink or drugs she would smell of alcohol, stale alcohol. She would - the way she presented herself you could tell.
- F** Q. Thank you. And then we know that during this period of time from the records there would be times when she would be self-harming?
- A. Yes.
- G** Q. Is that something that you were aware of?
- A. Yes, she used to self-harm. Often, after coming back, she'd go in the bath for ages and we'd - sometimes we'd not know but we'd see marks on her clothing where she had cut the tops of her legs. It was the tops of her legs that she used to cut. Sometimes, she'd be
- H**

- A** very secretive about it. She didn't like you to know that she'd done it. Other times, she would tell you if she went a bit too far, she would tell us.
- Q. You've told us a lot of information then and I think what you said was often when she was coming back?
- B** A. Yes.
- Q. And, again, do you mean coming back from these nights out?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Yes. And you said she would often be in the bath for ages?
- A. Yes.
- C** Q. And what about her mood on those occasions?
- A. She often came back in a very low mood.
- Q. Thank you. A couple of other things that I need to deal with now, please. Did you have to deal with [Person A1]'s clothing?
- A. Yes.
- D** Q. Did you have to deal with her used clothing?
- A. Yes.
- Q. How did that present, how did her underwear present?
- A. After various meetings and us all sort of listening to what [Person A1] told us
- E** happened and we could sort of notice, we did all then get provided with gloves. So if we were touching [Person A1]'s clothing because there'd often be stains and things like that on them, so we always used gloves to handle any of her clothing.
- Q. So in terms of - I'll come on to deal just briefly with the issue as regards the bleeding and the periods, but in terms of the state of her clothing what were you able to observe in her used underwear?
- F** A. When she went out, she - she did like to buy a lot of underwear and tights and things like that and she would come back with, usually in the same clothes or perhaps a couple of changes of clothing but often numerous amounts of underwear in the - in the bag would be there for us to deal with.
- G** Q. Was there evidence of sexual activity in the underwear?
- A. Yes.
- Q. And is it right also that [Person A1] had an issue as regards her periods, she would bleed very heavily?
- A. Yes, she did.
- H** Q. Right. And did she discuss with you then the issue sometimes of when she went out?

A

A. Yes, one ---

Q. Having a very heavy period.

B

A. Yes, one day she did say that she'd gone out and I'm near enough sure it was a Friday night and we've reported her and was just - her usual pattern was that she wouldn't come home while later on and she came home really early and we were like, oh, you know, we're really pleased you're back and she did say that she'd come back because she'd come on her period and she was really unhappy about it because she'd had to come home because of it.

C

Q. Thank you very much. Now I just want to take you to the records just to deal with a few entries. Not very many, please, Ms [REDACTED]. Yes, there's a file up there that you have, 139, please. It's right near the end. Do that you have that, page 139?

A. I do, yes.

Q. OK. This is an entry from the 12th of August 2010.

A. Yes.

D

Q. OK. And can you just confirm, please, that this was - although this entry isn't from you, what it deals with is the fact that you had made contact, it seems, that they had contact from you in which you were making clear that the police officer we've actually heard from in this case, Karen George, was now dealing with information as regards [Person A1]'s contact with Sid?

E

A. Yes.

Q. OK, thank you. And without going into the details, it was clear at this point that the police had - were dealing with, I know there's no dispute about it with Mr Saeed Akhtar?

A. Yes.

F

Q. Thank you. Onto page 144, please. I think this is now from the 13th of September the 2010 and this is one of the meetings that I think that you've mentioned previously, joint meetings that would be held with the police and so forth, and it was understood that there was little that could be offered in terms of protection for [Person A1]?

A. Yes.

G

Q. All right. And then there was consideration there of a harbouring notice being issued against Saeed Akhtar at [REDACTED]?

A. Yes.

H

Q. Thank you. 149, please. In fact, I don't need you to read through this page, Ms [REDACTED]. I'll deal with it in a specific way, if I may. Because, again, this is an entry from you but it's an entry from the 4th of October 2010 when a phone call was made by you indicating

- A** that [Person A1] had come back on Saturday and had made a complaint of a sexual offence towards her, yes?
- A. Yes.
- Q. And you - as you indicated on the phone, you - that you said normally that if
- B** something happened, [Person A1] would stay up the rest of the weekend, get drunk and use drugs, yes?
- A. Yes.
- Q. To blot out what had happened, had done the right thing and returned home to her place of safety, yes?
- C** A. Yes.
- Q. Where, of course, she still did have a supported placement. At that stage, [Person A1] indicated that it had taken place in her house, there had been a number of males - and just to be absolutely clear, that although we've already touched upon the fact that [Person A1] had spoken to you of sexual activity can Sid, that this isn't an incident?
- D** A. No.
- Q. Relating to him, just to - I've been asked to make that clear and I happily do so. That the sexual offence had taken place in a bathroom in a house?
- A. Yes.
- Q. All right, thank you. In relation to that incident and that disclosure by [Person A1] which clearly you then passed on to others appropriately, Ms ██████, yes?
- E** A. Yes.
- Q. Is it right that there was some consideration of the police being involved in reporting that to the police?
- F** A. Yes.
- Q. And did the police then later attend, do you recall?
- A. There was an occasion that I can remember where the police attended.
- Q. Yes.
- A. I'm near enough sure it was a Saturday morning, because of the staff that were on and
- G** the staff that were on were only weekend and they rang for me to go in because I were [Person A1]'s key worker and she wouldn't really talk to other people regarding it.
- Q. Thank you very much. But was it the case that, finally, that that case for whatever reasons wasn't then ultimately pursued?
- A. No, it wasn't, no.
- H** Q. Is that right?

A

A. Yes.

Q. OK, thank very much. And had [Person A1] kept the clothing in relation to that incident?

A. The police took the clothing when they came that morning.

B

MS MELLY: All right, thank you very much.

MR WILSON: No questions, thank you.

Cross-examined by MR MOULSON

Q. Ms [REDACTED], I don't think I'll keep you very long and I think there's a broad measure of agreement between us as you may remember from last time. But a few questions, please.

C

A. Yes.

Q. You were dealing with [Person A1] when she was aged 17, is that correct?

A. Yes.

Q. Thank you. And just a few questions about the man, Sid. Did you associate the arrival of Sid with a silver car?

D

A. I did, yes.

Q. You did. And that's what you told the police?

A. Yes.

Q. Yes. Perhaps in meetings or from knowledge passed on to you by others, were you ever made aware that the name or nickname, Sid, was perhaps commonly used by those with an interest in sexual activity with young females?

E

A. Never.

Q. Never?

A. That's the first time I've ever heard that.

F

Q. Right. I wonder if I could just refer you then, please, to a note we have of a meeting held on the 13th of September of 2010. Those at the meeting were [REDACTED]

[REDACTED] Karen George, [Person YY2], Suzanne [REDACTED]

[REDACTED] do you recall attending meetings with those people?

A. We did go to, yes, meetings, yes.

G

Q. Right. I just wonder whether this would jog, there's no criticism, I just wonder whether this will jog your memory. We are going back to 2010.

A. Yes, sorry.

Q. Not at all, no, no, it's absolutely fine. And, please, understand there's no criticism at all. "[REDACTED] informed the meeting that the majority of the concerns related to

H

an Asian male who was known to the young people as Sid. KG confirmed [Karen George]

- A** that the individual known as Sid in relation to those significant concerns was Saeed Akhtar. Professionals acknowledged that the name Sid was commonly used in the Bradford area and some doubt was cast as to whether this particular individual was the same person who had previously been discussed in previous meetings". Does that help your memory about that?
- B** A. No, sorry.
Q. All right, thank you very much indeed. As I say, no criticism. Different vehicles arrived at the premises and [Person A1] would get in them, is that right?
A. Yes.
Q. Did she usually make reference to being picked up by Sid though when those different
- C** vehicles arrived?
A. She did - she'd mainly speak and tell us that she was on the phone on her mobile.
Q. Yes.
A. That it was to Sid and that there was arrangements for her to be picked up.
Q. Yes.
- D** A. And then she'd be picked up.
Q. You can't say whether the same person?
A. No.
Q. Or a different person picked her up?
- E** A. No, I can't.
Q. On any particular occasion?
A. No.
Q. OK. Just as regards her mobile telephone, did you ever see a list of contacts in that phone?
- F** A. I can't recall whether I did or didn't, sorry.
Q. Did you ever see a list of contacts that she'd written down in long hand, as it were?
A. No, she used her phone.
Q. She used her phone, thank you. Did you ever become aware that there was more than one Sid either in that contacts menu in the phone or on a written document?
- G** A. No.
Q. No, thank you. She referred, didn't she, to having had sex with Sid?
A. Yes.
Q. Yes. And you've described her reaction upon telling you that, is that right? She never complained, did she, of being raped by Sid?
- H** A. No, she - no.

A Q. No.
A. Not to me, no, she ---
Q. Not to you?
A. She - she trusted him and as much as our judgment was that we needed to change the

B people that she was with ---
Q. Yes.
A. --- [Person A1] was quite happy.
Q. And she never complained of any adverse sexual activity with him?
A. No.

C Q. Or that she'd been sent out to work as a prostitute by him?
A. Did she think?
Q. Did she ever say to you that he sent me out to work as a prostitute?
A. No.

D Q. No. Or to get drugs for him?
A. No.
MR MOULSON: No. Yes, thank you very much indeed. I have nothing further, thank you.
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Thank you. Nothing?
MS MELLY: No, thank you.
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: No. Thank you very much. Thanks for coming.

E WITNESS: Thank you.
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Thank you. Thanks a lot.
(The witness withdrew)

F MS MELLY: Thank you. Well, that concludes the live witnesses for today, as we explained.
And although we do return, of course, to live evidence other than [Person A], the bulk of the remaining case will be [Person A]'s evidence and it commences with the video recordings that were made at the police station now some years ago. I have the first DVD which can be played. We hope the sound quality is sufficient so that the jury can just watch it through without the transcripts, but perhaps we need to commence it and see how we go. The first

G DVD, I've had the list of times through, is an hour and 10 minutes.
JUDGE DURHAM HALL: All right. We're just going to do this one this afternoon, OK.
I'm going to tell the jury, Ms Melly and Mr Wilson.
MR WILSON: Yes, of course.

H JUDGE DURHAM HALL: That it won't be anybody here or [Person A1]'s fault if the quality is poor.

A MR WILSON: Yes.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Perennial problem with the compatibility, the quality of the machinery then and there is provision if inaudibility really creeps in to let you look at the transcript to follow it. But that is a last resort, ladies and gentlemen, because you have to

B imagine this witness as if she's here and, just as you don't get witness statements which are no more than an aide memoir to the evidence to be given, we prefer if you try and concentrate on the screen on the speaker. But if it becomes impossible, don't worry, everybody agrees, we can assist you. But can we try. That's what you want to do and I agree. We're going to try.

C MS MELLY: May we also just say this, by way of introduction. I know that your Honour will be aware of this. The first few DVD recordings we are going to watch are where [Person A1] describes freely what takes place. The jury ought not to be concerned that that is the only description of the matters that we say are on the indictment. The officer returns and deals with it then in the later DVDs in a clearer way.

D JUDGE DURHAM HALL: All right.

MS MELLY: So in this we just sort of have quite a lot of free narrative of [Person A1] describing events.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: So we're going to get an overview.

MS MELLY: Yes.

E JUDGE DURHAM HALL: And then we're going to descend, come back to particulars later on.

MS MELLY: Thank you.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Well, that's as it should be.

F MS MELLY: Thank you.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Do you have a copy for me?

MS MELLY: Of the transcripts? Yes, we do. I'm more concerned by the statement across the screen which wasn't shown perhaps half an hour ago.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: One of the advantages of wearing silk is that you can clean the

G DVD, I think.

MS MELLY: It comes equipped.

(ABE interview played)

MS MELLY: I'm not proving to be very successful in dealing with this glitch that's on the

H DVD. It absolutely was not there. Every single one of these disks have been watched

A through by Ms Beattie and the officer and there have been no difficulties with them so I'm just going to try and rectify it, but it might be easier to do it in the absence of the jury.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Not to worry.

MS MELLY: Thank you.

B JUDGE DURHAM HALL: We can sort this and we will sort this. If necessary, I'll bring in new equipment from something. Let's, first instance, can you just give them five minutes, see what they can do. The times this happens, ladies and gentlemen, it is unbelievable - it is sad but it is unbelievable. No fault. If we can't sort it, don't worry. For the sake of half an hour, 40 minutes we'll start again tomorrow morning.

C (The jury left court at 15.02)

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

D [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

E [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

(Short adjournment)

[REDACTED]

F [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

(The jury entered court at 15.16)

G JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Thank you. Fingers crossed we should be OK, thank you.

MS MELLY: Thank you. It's just a few seconds before we (inaudible).

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Yes.

(ABE interview played)

MS MELLY: The witness moves on to deal with a separate topic.

H JUDGE DURHAM HALL: No, very very good.

A MS MELLY: So that would seem a convenient point. I just make one point clear before we do leave today, if I may. The jury will have noticed a reference to, "Pav working in a car wash" and also Parvaze Ahmed being mentioned. They're not the same people. It is Parvaze Ahmed who stands trial in this dock not Pav who was working at the car wash.

B JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Thank you.

MS MELLY: We haven't gone on to deal with the allegations anyway, but I make that clear at this stage.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: No, no. Well, there are a number of names mentioned.

MS MELLY: Yes.

C JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Some of whom maybe are here and some of whom are not.

MS MELLY: That is quite right, your Honour.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Did we cover the bit in the - did we look at it with you, the talk about men, presumably men coming from Birmingham, Rochdale, Oldham, London, have we got to that bit?

D MS MELLY: There's a - we've just dealt with it.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: We just dealt with that.

MS MELLY: Very briefly, yes.

E JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Right, OK, that's fine, good, so I'm looking ahead all the time to try and make sure I get a note of the basis obviously to help you later, all right. Thanks very much, ladies and gentlemen. I'm glad we've made a start. You're seeing the witness and just remember, please, not to form any views at all about this case. You'll remember my warnings, no making decisions until all 12 of you really have heard it all, heard speeches, my directions are in the privacy of your room. But when you're dealing particularly with [Person
F A1], although you may or may not be forming a view, that's why you're here. Remember, there's a lot more to come, plus cross-examination and so on. OK. So with an open mind, see you tomorrow, 10 o'clock. More of the same, I'm afraid. But we'll only do it in se two and a bit hour shifts because it's quite a lot, OK. Thanks very much. See you tomorrow. 10 o'clock OK? Really? Good, good.

G (The jury left court at 15.53)

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Right, Mr Bell.

H MR BELL: Your Honour, can I just raise a matter very briefly. Today, Parvaze Ahmed was not listed initially as on the court list or at least such that I could sign on an exhibit. It happened a few times in the last trial and caused me no end of difficulty for reasons that your Honour will understand. But I'm simply asking your Honour, indeed the clerk through your

A

Honour, that one hopes that he would always be listed every day because I intend to be here every day.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Now don't you worry about that, Mr Bell. If I may say, you're a good attender.

B

MR BELL: I'll say no more.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: A good attender on every day. Could you please, this is - you can pass on to whoever does this list, this is not right, it is wrong.

THE COURT CLERK: It's the first time I've seen it.

C

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: It is and I'm not looking at this sort of thing, Mr Bell, but I've got a very good associate who will make sure.

MR BELL: He's excellent.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: He is, as it happens, excellent, I agree. I associate myself with that remark wholeheartedly. Ah, God. Can you just make sure it doesn't happen? Thanks ever so much. It's not fair. It's not right. It's discourteous.

D

MR BELL: Thank you, your Honour.

JUDGE DURHAM HALL: Thank you very much. Thank you, gentlemen. Those of you who can go, I suggest you go. And I hope Mr Saeed, is it Saeed Akhtar's cough gets better and if you caught it from me I am sorry.

E

ADJOURNED AT 15.55 UNTIL FRIDAY, 18th JANUARY 2019

eScribers hereby certify that the above is an accurate and complete record of the proceedings or part thereof having used our best skill and ability in its production.

F

G

H